

**List of Challenges to Resources and Policies
Reported by Publicly-Funded Canadian Libraries, 2008**

Challenges are listed alphabetically by number of challenges per item. (Note that unverified bibliographic data are recorded here as originally supplied by library officials who contributed to the annual survey.)

Collection of items – 1 challenge each:

Adult rated graphic novels in general

Catholic school board textbooks

Islamic pamphlets

Series – 1 challenge each:

Scooby Doo (series of 7 titles), various authors

Individual item – 3 challenges each:

Blubber by Judy Blume

Borat (DVD) directed by Larry Charles

Individual item – 2 challenges each:

Angels in America (DVD)

Quid Pro Quo by Vicki Grant

Sagard's Long Journey to the Country of the Hurons by Gabriel Sagard

"Venus on the Toilet" (artwork)

Individual item – 1 challenge each:

The Absolutely True Diary of a Part-time Indian by Sherman Alexie

The Adventures of Sherlock Holmes by Arthur Conan Doyle

A.L.I.E.E.N. by Lewis Trondheim

And Tango Makes Three by Peter Parnell and Justin Richardson

Another Kind of Cowboy by Susan Juby

Away from Her (DVD)

Bad Santa (DVD)

Batman: Gotham Knight (DVD)

Bear Cub (DVD)

Beyond the Dark by Angela Knight
The Big Book of Porn: A Penetrating Look at the World of Dirty Movies by Seth Grahame-Smith
Captain Hook by James Hart
A Child's Life and Other Stories by Pheobe Gloeckner
Christie Malry's Own Double Entry (DVD) directed by Paul Tickell
Confession of a Teen Nanny by Victoria Ashton
Crumb (DVD)
Dare to Discipline by James Dobson
Eat Your Peas by Kes Gray
The Family Book by Todd Parr
A Field Guide for Female Interrogators by Coco Fusco
First Nations? Second Thoughts by Tom Flanagan
Gadget Nation by Steve Greenberg
Half Nelson DVD, directed by Ryan Fleck
Harold & Kumar Escape from Guantanamo Bay (DVD)
If Democrats Had Any Brains, They Would Be Republicans by Ann Coulter
Ladies of the Lair by Bianca d'Arc
Lemonade Club by Patricia Polacco
The Little Girl Who was too Fond of Matches by Gaetan Soucy
Little House on the Prairie (DVD)
Mog & the Granny by Judith Kerr
No More Bull! The Mad Cowboy Targets America's Worst Enemy: Our Diet by Howard F. Lyman
Not Now, Bernard by David McKee
Nuggets CD, by Iggy Pop
The Other Hollywood: The Uncensored Oral History of the Porn Film Industry by Legs McNeil and Jennifer Osborne
The pH Miracle for Weight Loss
Pineapple Express (DVD)
Pornology, by Ayn Carrillo-Gailey
Primal Fear (VHS)
Raspberries on the Yangtze by Karen Wallace
Shortbus (DVD)
Sink or Swim by Kate Cann

Sippy Cunts (artwork)
The Sisterhood of the Traveling Pants by Ann Brashares
Snowboarder (DVD) directed by Olias Barco
Solids, Liquids and Gases by J.M. Patten
Stepbrothers (DVD)
"Troll Bridge," story in *M is for Magic* by Neil Gaiman
Three Wishes by Deborah Ellis
To Kill a Mockingbird by Harper Lee
Tom of Finland: The Comic Collection by Tom of Finland
Trudnaia Mishen by Ilia Derevianko
The Witch's Child by Arthur Yorinks

artwork (untitled)
a book by Adolf Hitler (unnamed)
a book with racist portrayal (unnamed)

Policies – 1 challenge each:

Library Internet access procedures requiring patrons sign and show a card to library staff before access
Library collection policy regarding donation of self-published book not accepted
Access restricted to police training videos
Complaint that library does not hold enough books on Catholicism
Library collection policy on books with sexual scenes
Library restricted collection use policy requiring patrons to access room with a staff member and sign out material to membership card
Library policy on procedures for challenging materials and lack of public participation in policy development
Library Internet service policy on filtering public workstations

Survey of Challenges to Resources and Policies Reported by Publicly-Funded Canadian Libraries, 2008

	Material type	Bibliographic info/Policy title	Reason and reason details	Who made complaint?	Type of Library	Final response and details	Province/Territory
1	Book	The Sisterhood of the Traveling Pants/ Ann Brashares,	-Sexually explicit. "The teacher objected to having the book in the K-6 collection because "one of the characters loses her virginity."	Teacher	K-12 school	Material removed. "The teacher-librarian reviewed the book and removed it from the collection because it was age inappropriate (YA material)."	Alberta
2	VHS	Primal Fear	-Sexually explicit -Anti-family -Offensive language	Patron	Public	Material retained	Ontario
3	Graphic novels	Tom of Finland : the comic collection / Tom of Finland	Homosexuality -Sexually explicit "The artwork is offensive to some people."	Library staff member Alumnus	Academic	Material retained. "I listened to the complaints and responded that I was not going to remove the item from the library."	Ontario
4	Policy	Internet Access procedures	"1. Internet Access users are required to read the rules of use of public library computers, and sign a card indicating they have done so and agree to abide by them. (Minors must have a parent or guardian sign as well). They are then instructed to bring the card and show it to library staff in order to gain access. Several patrons object having to show the card. 2. RCMP called to inquire if a certain individual ever used the library's computers to access the Internet. This person was under an injunction no to access the Internet. Police later came to library and arrested the individual. His computer access card was seized by library staff."	Patron RCMP	Public	"Staff continue to uphold policy and patrons are encouraged to follow up their concerns with letters to the Board. So far no one has taken the next step. Staff are investigating the possibility of a technological solution, with a User Agreement that must be agreed to before being able to log on to the workstation. (Minors, however, would continue to have to show a card indicating parental consent.)"	Alberta
5	Book	Gadget Nation by Steve Greenberg	Insensitivity Sexism "Some elementary teacher librarians received this book from a centrally organized purchase; team included itinerant resource teacher (Library & Literacy) and a team of elementary teacher librarians. Via our teacher librarian list serve, early after books arrived in the schools, some teacher librarians noted and objected to sexualized photos/articles. Two examples, a giant red bow a woman could wear to greet her husband -- only wearing the red bow, and conedoms, a product that holds ice cream cones and prevents dripping ice cream from escaping -- the play on condom was intentional and obvious. Most of the book's contents were seen as fine for elementary school libraries."	Superintendent	K-12 School	Material restricted. "There wasn't a formal challenge. A superintendent saw the sensitive pieces and directed that the book would not be displayed until a review was completed. A team including an itinerant resource teacher (Library and Literacy), teacher librarians (elementary and secondary) and a principal reviewed our board's Learning Materials Selection/Use Policy and the Gadget Nation book. We did not feel this book was appropriate for elementary schools unless it was used for instructional purposes. A few schools removed/covered the "sensitive" pages and included the book into circulation. We had some concerns about people editing/ censoring the book as it was intended. We did not come up with a definitive answer on when/how teacher librarians The committee prepared a report that basically said our policy is sound and that challenges going beyond the informal level were very rare. That is, teacher librarians are resolving challenges at the school/informal level -- discussion and education and selection choices are working well. The committee was concerned that this indicates the challenge process can be surpassed by people in positions of authority. Two pertinent committee recommendations: 1. Purchasing/selections should take place at the school level by teacher librarians as they best know their collection needs and user needs/wants. 2. Teacher librarians are involved and committed to purchasing learning materials with purpose and intention in mind. Teacher librarians can be trusted. Given the number of "heads ups" comments on our teacher librarian list serve, teacher librarians are seen to be doing an excellent job with learning materials selections. Interesting fact, there were no reports of this book being circulated before hand. Our report hasn't been responded to yet."	Ontario

	Material type	Bibliographic info/Policy title	Reason and reason details	Who made complaint?	Type of Library	Final response and details	Province/Territory
6	Book	Blubber by Jude Blume (3 challenges)	- Insensitivity "Patrons felt that the book supported teasing over weight kids."	Patron K-12 school student Parent/ guardian	Public	Material retained "Item was reviewed, decision was made to retain it, letter was sent to patrons."	Ontario
7	Policy	The Library's collections policy	"Patron is a self-published author who presented his book to the library. The book did not fit the library's selection criteria and book was not added to the collection."	Patron	Public	Material not added to the collection. "Patron initiated a Human Rights complaint claiming religious discrimination. The complaint was addressed through mediation. An agreement was signed absolving the library of any liability or wrongdoing. Patron has advised library that he will be taking the case to civil court."	Ontario
8	-Book - Photograph/ Image -2 challenges	Sagard's long journey to the country of the Hurons by Sagard, Gabriel	-Anti-ethnicity -Insensitivity -Racism -Offensive language "For the book, Native peoples were called savages. The patron could not understand that one had to look at the historical context. For the photo, the building was called the Orillia Asylum for Idiots, again that was what it was called, at that time."	Patrons	Public	Material retained. "a letter was written to each person, explaining the need to address the historical context of the challenged material"	Ontario
9	DVD	Stepbrothers	-Sexually explicit -Anti-family -Offensive language	Parent/ guardian	Public	Material retained	Ontario
10	DVD	Borat (directed by Larry Charles)	-Anti-ethnicity -Nudity -Offensive language "The patron felt that the film should not be in a public library, available for borrowing, due to offensive language, nudity, and general rude behaviours depicted in the film."	Patron	Public	Material retained "A letter was written to the patron explaining that public libraries do not rate films, and that, though the comedy is not to everyone's taste, our library would retain the film in our collection. We encourage people to preview materials before viewing them in the presence of children, according to their own tastes and viewpoints."	Ontario
11	Book	The Family Book	-Homosexuality -Age inappropriate "This patron didn't think it was appropriate that we have this book for children."	Patron	Public	Material retained "The staff member that dealt with the patron explained that we are a public library and our job is to have a diverse collection available to everyone including children with same sex parents. The staff member also explained that it is the parents' job to pre-read items they do not think their children should read. The staff then brought the patron's attention to other items that this patron thought were ok and advised that not everyone thought it was suitable for our library. The patron understood at that time what we stand for and dropped the issue."	Alberta
12	Book	Pornology, by Ayn Carrillo-Gailey	-Sexually explicit "Pornology: "A good girl's guide to porn." Author calls herself the world's first anthropornologist. Patron felt based on synopsis on back cover that book should be removed from shelves at all 6 locations. Patron felt libraries should uphold moral values."	Patron	Public	Material retained "Book reviews & usage were reviewed. Book is "chick lit" memoir by a young woman exploring the world of pornography. Well reviewed, good Amazon ranking"	Ontario

	Material type	Bibliographic info/Policy title	Reason and reason details	Who made complaint?	Type of Library	Final response and details	Province/Territory
13	Textbook	Catholic school board textbooks	- Religious viewpoint "One of the library technicians (a convert to Evangelical Protestantism from the Catholic faith) felt that the textbooks were "heretical". He wanted special labels to be placed on the textbooks that warn Protestant Sunday school teachers that the materials were Catholic and "not Christian". He feared that the teachers might not be able to distinguish between the two."	Library staff member	Academic	Material retained "The technician first presented the request to the librarian-in-charge. After the librarian-in-charge explained that it was not the library's role to interfere with users' choice of materials in any way, the technician then took the request to the library director. The matter was discussed among the librarian-in-charge and two of the senior staff members at [...]. The request was turned down for the reason that the Catholic School textbook collection was not a large enough part of the collection to merit special labels being put on the books."	Ontario
14	Book	Confessions of a teen nanny by Victoria Ashton	-Drugs/drug use -Offensive language -Age inappropriate "A grade 5 student challenged the book as inappropriate for her school."	K-12 school student	K-12 school	Material removed "The book was removed from this school and put in a 7-8 school library."	Ontario
15	Books	Scooby Doo - Various Authors	-Violence -Does not support curriculum "Use of slang, based on a TV show child is not allowed to watch. Better books available."	Parent/guardian	K-12 school	Material retained "Questioned myself and principal. Told about free choice, where other books are. Parent still challenged that the book was bought with board/public money."	Ontario
16	Book	Eat Your Peas by Kes Gray	poor parenting techniques "comments were: I read my son this book and I was amazed at the resolution of the book. The mother deserves the worst parent of the year award. Please put this piece of trash where it belongs."	Parent/guardian	Public	Material removed "I found great reviews of the book because it was done by a well-known author and illustrator. I told her I agreed that the parenting technique was not something that I would do with two small children, but that the author and illustrator were using exaggeration to create a fantasy-like situation that would definitely not happen in real life. I told her that the humour was for the upper end of preschool (age 5) up to Kindergarten. I quoted lots of reviews and attached them. One said, "Parents and caregivers may cringe inwardly, but preschoolers will love the increasingly exorbitant bribes Daisy's mothers proffers. While this may not convert any readers into avid pea fans, the underlying message that everyone has individual tastes should help to diffuse dinnertime tensions."	BC
17	Books	[.....] Secondary School Board	downsizing of library and library staff	School administrator Superintendent	K-12 school	Material removed [sounds like this was the closure of a school library]	
18	DVD	Snowboarder (directed by Olias Barco)	- Sexually explicit "Patron felt that the 14A rating of the film was inappropriate, and wanted the item restricted, to be borrowed only by patrons 18 years and older."	Patron Parent/guardian	PUBLIC	Material retained "The library explained that we do not rate films, and that we encourage patrons to preview any materials before viewing them in the presence of children."	Ontario
19	Book	Another kind of cowboy / Susan Juby	-Homosexuality "Contains a gay character"	School administrator	K-12 school	"Material was donated to the [.....] Public Library (which is actually where the person filling out this survey is employed). Free public library memberships were made available to any student in the school who wanted to read the book." "The librarian has decided to not tell the principal what she's buying anymore. It improved our inter-library relationship... we now communicate regularly to make sure kids are getting the books they need/want."	Alberta

	Material type	Bibliographic info/Policy title	Reason and reason details	Who made complaint?	Type of Library	Final response and details	Province/Territory
20	Book	"No more bull! The mad cowboy targets America's worst enemy: our diet" by Howard F. Lyman	-Political viewpoint "Patron accused the author of imposing his vegan viewpoint on the general public."	Patron	Public	Material retained "The library responded that it is our mandate to carry materials that represent all viewpoints on issues of general interest, and that we carry a wide range of cookbooks, from vegan to meat dishes."	Ontario
21	Book	"If Democrats had any brains, they would be Republicans" by Ann Coulter	- Political viewpoint "The patron objected to the extreme and potentially offensive topic of the book."	Patron	Public	Material retained "We told the patron that it was our library's mandate to provide materials representing all viewpoints on general topics of interest."	Ontario
22	Artwork/graphic novels	Adult rated Graphic novels in general	-Nudity -Sexually explicit -Age inappropriate "The adult graphic novels were in a section buy themselves to make them easier for patrons to find. The patron's minor child was found with some of the material in his room. It was later discovered that another minor stole the materials from the collection and passed on photo copies of the offensive material to the patron's minor child."	Patron Parent/guardian	Public	Material retained "The adult graphic novel collection was mixed back into the main collection. And the library director posted the CLA freedom to read policy in various locations around the library."	Alberta
23	CD/ROM	Police training videos	Restricted materials "The material (a series of videos) show techniques only to be shown to students in police foundations"	Teacher	Academic	Material restricted "The material is accessible only to police foundations students or teachers"	Ontario
24	DVD	Bad Santa	- Sexually explicit "Patron objected to the pseudo sexual assault of a male by a male. Patron did not object to the explicit male/female sex scene that immediately preceded the objected to scene."	Patron	Public	Material removed "It was felt that the material, while rated not rated as 18A or Restricted, was inappropriate for the collection given the theme - Christmas, as young children might select it due to the title."	Ontario
25	DVD	Borat	-Nudity -Sexually explicit -Offensive language "Patron felt that it has "extremely obscene and ethnic hate provoking nature".	Patron	Public	Material retained "Responded to customer with the explanation of the collection development policy." "We invited the customer to have further dialogue if choose to do so but the customer had taken no further action."	Ontario
26	Book	child's life and other stories - Pheobe Gloeckner	-Insensitivity -Nudity -Sexually explicit -Anti-family -Violence	Patron	Public	Material retained "Director of library refused to pursue because there was no formal written complaint."	BC
27	Book	Three Wishes - Deborah Ellis	-Political viewpoint -Religious viewpoint -Age inappropriate "Sympathetic reference to the sister of a suicide bomber"	Interest group	K-12 school	Material removed "My principal asked to see the book and never gave it back. The book was a Silver Birch non-fiction nominee and was not removed from the list. Some children purchased the book, and voted for it anyway. I was unhappy. I felt powerless. In the end, Ellis probably sold MORE copies of the book due to the publicity."	Ontario
28	Book Sound recording	Captain Hook by James Hart	- Age inappropriate "Patron just felt this book would be better in teen section rather than junior."	Patron	Public	Book was moved to Young Adult Section after staff read it and felt it was fine to put in Young Adult rather than Junior. "All resolved - patron happy and staff felt book was appropriate in a different section."	Ontario
29	Book	Raspberries on the Yangtze	-Sex education	Patron	Public	Material retained	Ontario

	Material type	Bibliographic info/Policy title	Reason and reason details	Who made complaint?	Type of Library	Final response and details	Province/Territory
		by Karen Wallace	-Sexually explicit -Age inappropriate "Patron felt that the overall theme of book is of sexual nature - teen neighbour becomes pregnant and runs off as seen through eyes of younger girl. Felt younger children may pick up inappropriate messages."			Kept in Junior section and not moved. "After staff read it, it was decided to keep book in Junior section and that it was appropriate for junior section. Letter sent to patron explaining our position."	
30	Books – 3 challenges	No response	-Racism -Political viewpoint -Religious viewpoint "Case 1: Library doesn't hold enough books on Catholicism. Case 2: Objection to book by Adolf Hitler. Case 3: Racist portrayal of a group in a particular title."	Post secondary students (3)	Academic	Material retained "Case 1: University of [...] has other libraries which hold religious materials; especially the Catholic college. Case 2 and 3: We invoked the freedom of expression statement to which libraries subscribe in Canada. No further action was required."	Ontario
31	Book	First Nations Second thoughts	-Racism -Political viewpoint "Politically unacceptable and racist"	Associate Professor	Academic	Material retained "[Intellectual Freedom] Policy was rewritten in clearer more affirmative language"	Manitoba
32	Book	Not Now Bernard by David McKee	Neglect of children "This book has no redeeming qualities and borders on supporting children being neglected by their parents."	Parent/guardian	Public	Material retained	Saskatchewan
33	Book	The Witch's Child by Arthur Yorinks	- Violence "Scary for kids. The witch coming after the child with knife disturbing."	Parent/guardian	Public	Material retained	Saskatchewan
34	Book	Quid Pro Quo by Vicki Grant	- Age inappropriate "This was a book in the Silver Birch reading list a couple of years ago and a parent felt the language and content was too mature."	Parent/guardian	K-12 school Private	Material restricted "We removed the book as a Silver Birch option but kept it in our older student's library"	Ontario
35	Artwork	"Venus on the toilet"	"Offensive." "From the complaint: "I find it offensive to walk past a picture of a woman using the toilet.""	Post secondary student	Academic	Material retained "A written response was provided, explaining the reasons this piece of art was included in the exhibition. The piece was not removed"	Alberta
36	Artwork	"Venus on the toilet"	"Distasteful" and "disrespectful." From the complaint: "Some of the art in the Library is very distasteful!! I don't need to see a woman with her pants down. I think it's very disrespectful."	Post secondary student	Academic	Material retained "A written response was provided, explaining the reasons this piece of art was included in the exhibition."	Alberta
37	Artwork	"Sippy cunts"	-Offensive language "The President objected to the use of the word "cunt" in the title of these ceramic pieces. He felt that, as a public facility which may be used by children, this was inappropriate."	President of the College	Academic	Material retained "When the complaint was brought to the attention of the artist, she volunteered to change the title to "Mrs. Sippy." This satisfied the President, and the artwork remained on display under the new title."	Alberta
38	Book	To kill a mockingbird	-Racism	School administrator	K-12 school	Material removed	Nova Scotia
39	Book DVD DVD (3 challenges)	a field guide for Female Interrogators by Coco Fusco 2. Bear cub 3. shortbus	1.Insensitivity 2.Homosexuality 3.Sexually explicit	Patron	Public	Material retained (all 3)	Ontario
40	Book	Beyond the Dark / Angela Knight	-Sexually explicit -Offensive language "The customer was offended by the language and the sexual content of the book, citing every page that had something offensive on it."	Patron	Public	Material retained "The customer was informed that the Library Board endorses the CLA's Statement of Intellectual Freedom, and included a copy. Some reviews of the book were attached, and a statement that libraries contain material that is offensive or unpopular to some people but of interest to others."	BC
41	Artwork	"Untitled"	- Nudity The complaint: "I am sending this email in regard to an art	Post secondary	Academic	Material retained "A written response was provided indicating the reasons this piece	Alberta

	Material type	Bibliographic info/Policy title	Reason and reason details	Who made complaint?	Type of Library	Final response and details	Province/Territory
			display in the [.....] library which I and many of my fellow female classmates find very offensive. It is on a large canvas to the left of the main entrance. The picture is of a naked woman lying on the floor with her legs open. The view is from the angle of her feet. If you do not know the piece I am speaking of, it is worth a walk to the library. Several months ago there was another art display that I was going to contact the college about, but didn't. It was pottery cups in the form of female genitalia with the words sippy c--- Is this the sort of art that should be displayed at the [.....] library? I think of the pre-school, coming down for library time. I think of members of the community who come to use the facilities. I think of myself and my classmates who have been made to feel most uncomfortable listening to comments from male students about the pottery cups while sitting in the chairs near the display. I would like you to understand - I am an artist. I love art. I love the human form as a work of art. However...I think these displays are crossing a line. My classmates have posed the question, "if an artist were to make a pottery sculpture or painting that had a focus on the male genitalia, would she/he be able to display it in the library?"	student		was included in the exhibition. The piece was relocated to another area of the library. In part, because of this complaint, but more so because the original location of this piece covered up another piece of art which was on the wall behind it. There are several other nude pieces in the same exhibition, including another one beside the front door, which have not received complaints (yet) and will not be moved."	
42	Book	Quid Pro Quo by Vicki Grant	-Sex education (rape) -Age inappropriate "The administrator felt that the chapter on rape was inappropriate for Grade 3-6 students"	School administrator	K-12 school	Material removed "The book was removed from a K-6 school and put into a 6, 7, 8 school instead."	Ontario
43	DVD	Crumb	-Sexism -pornographic "Patron felt this DVD was too pornographic and sexist to be in a public library."	Patron	Public	Material restricted "The DVD was made Restricted so that children could not watch it alone."	BC
44	Pamphlet/ other ephemera	Islamic pamphlets	-Religious viewpoint "Patron complained that pamphlets in free community publications area were propaganda."	Patron	Public	Material retained "Patron agreed free religious material was OK in the library, if not illegal or inciting hatred."	BC
45	Sound recording	M is for Magic (audio book) - Troll Bridge, by Neil Gaiman	- Age inappropriate "Patron considered one story not appropriate for children. Passage describing troll genitals."	Patron	Public	Material retained "after staff review, audiobook was reclassified from children's to young adult material"	BC
46	Book	Solids, Liquids and Gases, by J.M. Patten	- Inaccuracy "A teacher said this book had factual errors."	Teacher	Public	Material removed "Staff review found at least one factual error."	BC
47	Book	Absolute true diary of a part-time Indian by Sherman Alexie	-Sexually explicit "Father thought the book belonged in the adult section of the library."	Parent/guardian	Public	Material retained "Library Board wrote a letter to the parent explaining their decision for leaving the book in the Young Adult section."	Manitoba
48	DVD	Little House on the Prairie (Disney TV miniseries)	-Violence -Age inappropriate "Patron felt DVD was too violent for young children."	Patron	Public	Material retained "Staff reviewed the DVD in context and disagreed with patron. DVD is rated G or TV-PG."	BC
49	Policy	Right to carry books with sexual scenes/[Collection policy]	-Sexually explicit "Patron who challenged objected on religious grounds."	Patron	Public	Material retained	Manitoba
50	Policy	Restricted Use Room Policy	This houses a collection of local histories, rare books and at the time of the change, microfilm and archival material. We decided that patrons could access the room only with a staff	Patron	Public	The Board reviewed the complaint and decided not to make any changes to the policy.	Manitoba

	Material type	Bibliographic info/Policy title	Reason and reason details	Who made complaint?	Type of Library	Final response and details	Province/Territory
			member and had to use the material in a specified area outside of the room. We also had the patron sign out the material to their membership card. This was also a change to the previous policy.				
51	Book	Ladies of the Lair / Bianca d'Arc (author)	-Sexually explicit "The book appeared to be a Young Adult book, but it had sexually explicit material. The customer wanted the library to attach a warning label on the book."	Parent/guardian	Public	Material retained "Upon investigation, it was discovered the book cover had its own warning about explicit sex. The customer was also informed of the Library Board's policy regarding parental responsibility in monitoring a child's use of material."	BC
52	Sound recording	Nuggets / Iggy Pop	-Insensitivity -Offensive language "The customer was offended by the swearing and the "crap" that was on the CD, and that it was not suitable for minors. He felt our supplier was providing very poor quality titles."	Patron	Public	Material retained "The customer was informed of the Library Board's policy regarding parental responsibility for monitoring a child's use of material. He was also informed the library endorses the CLA Statement of Intellectual Freedom, and a copy was included."	BC
53	Book	The pH Miracle for Weight Loss	-Inaccuracy "Customer felt there was no scientific validity to this book and the Library was being irresponsible with funds purchasing such titles."	Patron	Public	Material retained "Information was collected about the author, other libraries holdings, publisher and reference was made to the Library's Collection Development Policy and a write up of all findings were presented to the customer - stating that in light of all evidence, the material would be retained."	Ontario
54	Book Textbook Magazine/ journal Newspaper Pamphlet/ other ephemera Government document Sound recording VHS CD/ROM DVD Online resource	No response	No response	Library staff member Library administrator	Academic	No response [somebody annoyed at some weeding?!]	Ontario
55	Book	The Other Hollywood: The uncensored oral history...	-Nudity -Sexually explicit "Perceived as being not appropriate and too explicit for public library"	Patron	Public	Material retained "Patron was sent letter and Canadian and Ontario Library Association Statement of Intell. Freedom"	Ontario
56	Book	The Big Book of Porn: a penetrating look at the world..	-Nudity -Sexually explicit "Book was perceived as inappropriate and too explicit for public library"	Patron	Public	Material retained "Patron was sent letter and Canadian and Ontario Library Association Statement of Intell. Freedom"	Ontario
57	DVD	Angels in America - DVD	-Sexually explicit -Offensive language "Patron complained about "foul language and incrimination of sexual nature"	Patron	Public	Material retained "DVD was retained, it is award-winning and well received. OFRB has given it a 14A rating"	Ontario

	Material type	Bibliographic info/Policy title	Reason and reason details	Who made complaint?	Type of Library	Final response and details	Province/Territory
58	DVD	Angels in America - DVD	-Sexually explicit -Offensive language "Patron complained about "foul language and incrimination of sexual nature""	Patron	Public	Material retained "DVD is award-winning and well received. OFRB gave it a 14A rating. Patron was informed of decision."	Ontario
59	Book	Dare to Discipline by Dr. James Dobson	"recommends inappropriate disciplining of children" "Patron does not agree with parenting style and theories of disciplining children"	Patron	Public	Material retained "Dr. Dobson is an author of international reputation. Based on his credentials and principles of intellectual freedom, we decided to keep the book."	Ontario
60	Book	Trudnaia mishen by Iliia Derevianko	-Anti-ethnicity -Political viewpoint "Russian book, perceived by patron as anti-American and anti-Canadian"	Patron	Public	Material retained "Book was read by two Russian-speaking staff who could not find any anti-American content."	Ontario
61	Book	Adventures of Sherlock Holmes, by Sir Arthur Conan Doyle	-Drugs/drug use -Age inappropriate "Parent felt that the description of the character's use of cocaine as a pain reliever and opium dens was inappropriate for children's reading level."	Parent/guardian	Public	Material retained "Library found several reviews of the work, reviews of literature explaining the historic use of cocaine analgesia and the prevalence of opium dens in Britain during the Victorian Period. These were attached to a letter explaining our policies on Intellectual Freedom and why we were keeping the book in the collection. A copy of our Materials Selection policy, the reviews and the letter were reviewed by the Director, Service Planning & Development and the CEO before mailing the package out. There was no response back from the customer."	Ontario
62	Book	"And Tango Makes Three" by Justin Richardson & Peter Parnell	Homosexuality	Parent/guardian	Public	Material retained "Library provided written response to customer and there was no further correspondence."	Ontario
63	Book	"Lemonade Club" by Patricia Polacco	-Age inappropriate "Need parental explanation in conjunction with subject matter of cancer"	Parent/guardian	Public	Book moved from picture book collection to parenting collection	Ontario
64	Book	"The Little Girl who was too fond of matches" by Gaetan Soucy	-Sexually explicit "Book not suitable for teens"	K-12 school student	Public	Material retained "Library provided written response to concern and there was no further correspondence."	Ontario
65	Book	"Sink or Swim" by Kate Cann	K-12 school student "Book not suitable for young teens"	K-12 school student	Public	Material retained "Library provided written response to concern and there was no further correspondence."	Ontario
66	Book	"A.L.I.E.E.N." by Lewis Trondheim	Depiction of Slavery "Book not suitable for teens"	K-12 school student	Public	Material retained "Library provided written response and there was no further correspondence."	Ontario
67	Policy	Delegation Policy (2 challenges)	The challenges were presented to the Board by two individuals, one representing himself, and another representing a community association. Concerns were: • the specificity of how input was to be given in the draft policy would create roadblocks for library users and community member/organizations to provide meaningful input • no public participation in the development of the policy	Interest group	Public	"Ad Hoc Committee of the Board was struck with Board, staff and public members; revised draft policy presented to Board in Sept 2008; public review was sought from previous delegations and community agencies; little response but favourable to draft policy; policy, more welcoming, accessible and convenient for the public in terms of presenting delegations was approved by the Board in Nov 2008"	Ontario
68	Policy	Internet Service Policy	"The Internet Service Policy review was undertaken by the Library, June to October 2007. Under this "draft" policy, most workstations were filtered in order to minimize the exposure of anyone using the Library to unintentional exposure to inappropriate sexual images on the screens, due to concerns raised by the public. During the review	Interest group	Public	"Legal advice was sought by the Board regarding concerns about constitutional rights and other matters of Library due diligence, along with comments contained in correspondence received in November 2007. Another policy review process was undertaken and new policy approved in November 2008. Major elements impacted are *[.....] PL will not limit access to Internet content except as	Ontario

	Material type	Bibliographic info/Policy title	Reason and reason details	Who made complaint?	Type of Library	Final response and details	Province/Territory
			period the effect of this change was studied: public response and impact on service. The policy was approved By the Board in November 2007. The policy was challenged for: * possible violation of Charter of Rights and Freedoms, section 2(b) (freedom of expression) *concerns re review methodology * concerns re due diligence processes"			outlined below. The [.....] Public Library will filter the following categories of computers: • Computers specifically designated for use by children and/or teens such as Homework Centres; • Computers in spaces specifically designed for use by children and/or teens; and • Computers designated for specific functions such as the Employment Resource Centre computers. All other computers will be unfiltered. Note: The exception to this would be in the case that all other methods of due diligence regarding the reasonable protection of children/teens cannot be achieved. *User responsibilities are outlined along with staff response requirements."	
69	DVD	Pineapple express	-Sexism -Drugs/drug use -Offensive language "Patron questioned the use of language in the film and subject material. She felt it was inappropriate for a "classy" public library."	Patron	Public	Material retained "Correspondence was sent to the patron with a link to the CLA "Statement of Intellectual Freedom" with an explanation that it isn't our role to censor material that some users might find objective. She did not take it to the library board as a result."	Ontario
70	DVD	Half Nelson directed by Ryan Fleck	-Racism -Drugs/drug use -exploits children "exploits kids, people of colour"	Patron	Public	Material retained "patron advised of decision in writing"	BC
71	DVD	Christie Malry's own double entry dir by Paul Tickell	-Sexism -Sexually explicit "hints of bestiality; degrading to women"	Patron	Public	Material retained "patron advised of decision in writing"	BC
72	DVD	Batman Gotham Knight (Warner Home Video)	-Violence -Age inappropriate "PG rating; too mature for children's collection"	Parent/guardian	Public	reclassified in adult DVD collection since based on adult graphic novel	BC
73	DVD	Harold & Kumar Escape from Guantanamo Bay	-Nudity -Sexually explicit -Offensive language "compromises community moral standards"	Patron	Public	Material retained	BC
74	DVD	Borat directed by Larry Charles	-Anti-ethnicity -Sexism -Political viewpoint -Offensive language -subversive "offensive"	Patron	Public	Material retained	BC
75	Book	Mog & the Granny by Judith Kerr	-Anti-ethnicity -Inaccuracy -Insensitivity -Racism -archaic viewpoint and language "reference to First Nations people as "Red Indians""	Parent/guardian	Public	Material removed	BC
76	DVD	Video- "Away from Her"	-Inaccuracy "In "Special Feature" section there was "sexual implications" offensive to patron" "Patron felt the material was inappropriate for any age."	Patron	Public	Material retained Note: There is a PG label	Manitoba