

**Guaranteeing Library Access to "All" Expression?
2014 Survey of Challenges to Resources and Policies in Canadian Libraries**

Alvin M. Schrader and Donna Bowman*
November 2015

What do all of these materials have in common?

- Nazi occultism in a graphic novel;
- a DVD laced with the “F word”;
- another DVD criticized for portrayal of driving under the influence;
- a children’s picture book rebuked for “promoting” a negative female body image;
- a series of graphic novels portraying violence and explicit sexuality;
- an adult novel deemed “too explicit for a public library collection” and inappropriate for any age group;
- a children’s picture book that traumatized a 10-year-old with “an exceedingly violent rabbit”;
- an adult graphic novel needing a parental warning on the cover;
- an apologia (“propaganda”) for the oil and gas industry;
- allegations in a biography of Dwight D. Eisenhower of a wartime extra-marital affair;
- a DVD offensively depicting sexism, nudity and drug use;
- grammatical errors in two Chinese children’s picture books;
- a DVD for young adults shelved in the children’s collection and neglecting to note the pervasive religious theme;
- a children’s picture book “spreading religious propaganda”;
- a DVD rated 14+ depicting unpunished sexual abuse;
- an audiobook with offensive language and explicit sexuality (“porn”) that was mistakenly thought to be a self-help book;
- a graphic novel purportedly showing a one-sided view of the Gaza Strip conflict;
- deeply racist portrayal of blacks in a famous classic film;
- a DVD with no warning it was about “ the homosexual lifestyle”;
- a book with allegedly defamatory references;
- a DVD featuring a young girl’s drowning and the murder-suicide of a couple;
- a DVD with disturbing police footage of a crime scene.

What these materials have in common is they were all owned by publicly funded libraries in 2014 and, more importantly, they were all challenged for expressive content considered objectionable, offensive, unsuitable, or otherwise unacceptable. Each time this happens, library staff are obliged to consider anew the question of universal access: Is restricted access or outright banning justifiable in terms of core professional values and the library's mission and policy statements?

The 2014 *Annual Challenges Survey*, conducted on a voluntary reporting basis for the ninth year under the auspices of the Canadian Library Association (CLA), creates a national snapshot of objections to materials, services, and policies related to library intellectual freedom and how Canadian libraries respond to pressures to ban, restrict, re-rate, reclassify, relocate, or label offending resources or to change existing access policies. Documenting and reporting such challenges is one way in which these publicly funded Canadian libraries demonstrate their commitment to institutional and professional accountability and transparency. The 2014 report includes a full listing of challenged titles and a comprehensive database of anonymized challenge details.

Library staff across Canada reported 108 challenges in 2014, 83 to library resources and 25 to library policies with intellectual freedom and access implications. Altogether, 65 individual complainants, primarily self-described library patrons, typically wanted (and sometimes demanded) that materials be banned or restricted in some way – adding warning labels, reclassifying and relocating items, re-rating and relocating DVDs, banning items outright, or changing existing library policies. Challenges were reported by 23 publicly-funded libraries in six provinces coast to coast, mostly public libraries, but a few academic and school libraries too. One school curriculum was also targeted. Individual titles were the targets of 80 percent of the challenges, and the others involved library intellectual freedom policies and principles governing access to collections, services, and library spaces.

Many more books than DVDs were contested in 2014, with graphic novels accounting for almost half of all book titles. An unprecedented four series of graphic novels totaling 23 titles (*Gangsta; I Don't like You at All, Big Brother; Oreimo; Vampire Cheerleaders*) were targeted in 2014, more than in any of the previous eight years of the survey. Also challenged were three titles in the DVD documentary series *Paradise Lost Trilogy*.

Adult titles in all formats were twice as likely to be challenged as children's titles, and among materials intended for adults, non-fiction outnumbered fiction challenges three to one. Challenges to picture books were more frequent than were those to all other children's materials combined.

The reasons complainants gave for challenging library resources were typically multi-layered and diverse, with two reasons per title on average. Some two-thirds of all challenges clustered around four broadly construed reasons: explicit sexuality, age inappropriateness, violence, and offensive language. This pattern has remained the same for four years, though the rankings have changed. Complainants cited

thirty-one other reasons in 2014, among them nudity, inaccuracy, political viewpoint, insensitivity, religious viewpoint, drugs/drug use, suicide, animal cruelty, hate incitement, homosexuality, ethnic stereotyping, bestiality, blasphemy, obscenity, outdated language, graphic pornographic conversation, Satanism, sexism, racism, and “inappropriate for any age.”

There were also 25 challenges involving thirteen different library policies related to intellectual freedom and access principles governing collections, services, and space. More than half of the total were linked to previously unsuccessful attempts by complainants to have individual items or series removed, restricted, reclassified, re-rated (DVDs), or labelled. Other challenges were to a library policy requiring special membership cards for people with disabilities; a policy permitting student computer use without time limits; a privacy policy preventing disclosure of library staff names and home addresses; a policy allowing unfiltered children’s Internet use; classification and physical location policies for book materials; policies on DVD ratings and rating systems; policies opposing the labelling of materials; a policy of unmonitored children’s library borrowing; a classification policy for Nazi occult material; a classification policy for juvenile materials; a policy on unrestricted access to particular titles; and a library’s request for reconsideration form.

Two unprecedented policy challenges were reported in K-12 schools, uncommon because each was lodged in order to defend and uphold open access to more diverse educational and library collections rather than to diminish access. Geographically distant from one another, the complainants opposed the unilateral implementation by school officials, without proper consultation, of massive book “levelling” programs. These practices amounted to indiscriminate withdrawal of untold hundreds of library and classroom materials. Such practices were argued to violate professional norms and standard policies for library collection management and to contravene students’ rights to age-appropriate learning materials.

In one institution, book levelling was justified on the grounds that allegedly outdated and inappropriate materials were being eliminated, and in the other that materials were being excluded because of purported irrelevance to “provincial curricula.” In both cases, complainants alleged that book levelling was being implemented in a very narrow manner that ignored the critical need by educators to acknowledge and facilitate independent, self-selected reading choices by young people across many different types of reading, in addition to prescribed curricular studies. Only one of the challenges was successful, and only after legal proceedings had been initiated.

After extensive research by library staff into the merits of each challenged item, four titles were withdrawn. They were *3D Printing*, the book compilation of Wikipedia articles; *Zheng Jiu Wang Yin Shao Nian*, a Chinese adult parental guide for children’s safe use of the internet for its gratuitous depiction of Falun Gong (but the library retained a research copy and subject headings were changed to reflect the content); *Cheng Shi Zhen Qing Hui Ben* for grammatical errors making it difficult to comprehend; and

Daniel Half Human, for gratuitous description of girls' breasts thought to be too graphic for 15 year old school boys. A curious case was of *Our Petroleum Challenge: Exploring Canada's Oil and Gas Industry*, a book challenged as "propaganda apologia for the tar sands industry," which on investigation was found not to be owned by the library and may have been informally "donated" to the collection.

Two-thirds of the 2014 challenges to materials or policies resulted in no change in status. Other challenges prompted 27 book and DVD titles being reclassified or re-rated, most, at 23 titles, involving the four graphic novel series mentioned above. Three titles were items labelled, and two were restricted. Only two of the 25 challenges to access and free expression policies were changed.

While ultimately just a few titles were removed, library staff never dismiss lightly the concerns expressed by complainants. Every request for reconsideration of library materials or a library policy requires that a defensible balance be struck between the merits of the complaint and the public's right to know. Every complaint is viewed within the context of professional core values and established library mandates and policies, including due process, as they relate to principles of intellectual freedom and access.

Few requests for reconsideration are straightforward. Each one must be assessed by staff on individual merit. Each one tests the evaluative standards of library decision-makers. And that means conducting extensive research into the "biography" of challenged materials, making critical assessments, taking all factors into account, and following up with respectful feedback to the complainant detailing the library's decision and reasons. An example from the 2014 survey is one public library's description of the steps it had taken in response to a demand to ban the children's picture book *Battle Bunny*:

"The book was evaluated by our librarians. We shared the opinion that the intent of the book was humour and satire. We felt that it might be particularly attractive to reluctant readers. Professional reviews were sought out. Very positive. Loan history reviewed: The book had been previously borrowed on four other occasions, without comment or complaint. Outcome: It was decided that the book would remain in the collection. A telephone message was left for the client, inviting her to discuss our decision. She did not call back."

To illustrate the perplexities in which library staff find themselves, one challenge, for example, was over the absence of a label on the cover of an audiobook version of Daniel Smith's *Monkey Mind: A Memoir of Anxiety* warning of its "dark adult content." Another concerned outdated language in *Music for Elementary Classroom Teachers* with a section entitled "The Mentally Retarded." In another complaint, the racist portrayal of African Americans in D.W. Griffith's *Birth of a Nation* was argued to make the DVD unsuitable for any public library collection. A group complained of gratuitous and purportedly misleading depictions inspiring hatred of the Falun Gong in a Chinese adult parental guide for children's

safe use of the Internet, *Zheng Jiu Wang Yin Shao Nian*. The book *3D Printing* was challenged as a misleading compilation of questionable Wikipedia articles.

In the illustrated early reader *Lili se fait piéger sur Internet*, a parent was concerned about a child's ability to understand what was happening in the children's picture book when protagonist Lili accidentally comes across "pornography" (actually cartoon images of naked adults) on the Internet. A university student complained that a sacred text should be shelved in a separate "revered" location, not in the general collection. The young adult DVD *Camp Harlow* was challenged for its classification in the children's collection as well as on the grounds of deceptive packaging because the cover failed to note the story's pervasive religious theme, and the complainant maintained this violated the Ontario Library Association's Statement on the Rights of the Individual in that "the provision of library service to the public is based on the right of the citizen to judge individually on questions of politics, religion and morality." The young adult novel *Daniel Half Human* was believed by a parent to be "too graphic for 15-year-old boys" to keep in a school library collection. In the only direct challenge to a school curriculum, a parent complained about the nature of the content – "pornographic; graphic pornographic conversation; vulgar; masturbation instructions; bestiality; offensive content; unsuitable for teens; suicide; violence" – in both the book and the DVD versions of *The Perks of Being a Wallflower*.

A university professor objected to the inclusion in a genocide collection of three "genocide denial books" discounting the Armenian massacres in Ottoman Turkey. The adult audiobook *Tough Sh*t: Life Advice from a Fat, Lazy Slob Who Did Good* appeared to a patron to be a self-help publication but the content was condemned as "porn." The DVD *Black Butterflies*, which deals with the subject of abortion, was deemed by one complainant to be graphic, offensive, violent, insensitive, and "a disturbance to decency."

While uncensored access to all constitutionally-protected, age-appropriate materials is the ideal, library and educational decision-makers are respectfully sensitive to the concerns of individuals and groups about all expressive content found in their collections that is, in the words of the Canadian Library Association's intellectual freedom statement, "unconventional, unpopular or unacceptable."

As Sandra Singh, CLA President and Chief Librarian of the Vancouver Public Library, notes:

"Intellectual freedom is fundamental to a free and democratic society, innovation, and human advancement. For well over 100 years, school, public, and academic libraries across Canada have worked tirelessly to ensure that every Canadian has access to the ideas and information they need to explore our world and enrich their lives. At times, this work has involved helping community members understand why libraries build broad collections that may contain materials considered offensive to some, as well as taking a stand against censorship when the need arises."

Given the nature of the complaints reported by libraries in the 2014 *Annual Challenges Survey*, the Advisory Committee on Intellectual Freedom suggests two policy areas meriting further attention by library decision-makers, film ratings and rating systems, and book levelling practices. In responding to challenges reported in recent surveys, the ratings of the U.S.-based Motion Picture Association of America (the MPAA) and/or those of the Canadian Home Video Rating System created by the Canadian Motion Picture Distributors Association (MPA-Canada) are frequently invoked. However, decision-makers need to be aware that both are voluntary industry classification systems and neither has legal standing in Canada (or the U.S.). The provincial rating systems, on the other hand, are legally binding unless libraries are specifically exempted.

Whether exempt or not, it is worth noting that it appears some libraries ignore their provincial/territorial rating system and privilege instead either of the voluntary systems. Reliance on the U.S.-based film industry system, the MPAA, is particularly troublesome because of its extreme secrecy and inherent U.S. cultural biases – among them, violence, gun culture, militarism, heterosexuality, and “clean language.” The 2006 documentary *This Movie is Not Yet Rated* is a highly recommended exposé of deceptive MPAA practices and misrepresentations.

MPA Canada ratings, on the other hand, are produced in an entirely different and transparent manner, consisting of an averaging of official provincial ratings. Examples from the 2014 survey of highly discrepant DVD ratings between the MPAA and the MPA Canada systems abound: *Black Butterflies* is rated 14A by the Ontario Film Review Board but R by the MPAA; similarly, *A Single Man* is rated PG by the Ontario Board in contrast to an MPAA rating of R. The same sort of discrepancies affect *Gangster Squad*, *Compliance*, and *Ted*, with MPA Canada designations of 14A and MPAA markers of R.

Another urgent area of concern for library decision-makers, and, more particularly, for K-12 educators relates to book levelling policies that have been adopted by an unknown number of school officials as well as by some provincial education ministries in Canada. Book levelling practices are highly controversial, in part because of the narrow range and rigidity of student reading interests that are assumed and thus imposed. Decades of reading research demonstrate time and again that young readers read up, read widely, and read with increasing skill and interest when voluntary choice free reading is supported and encouraged. Levelling ignores all of these reader realities. Indeed, the British Columbia Teacher-Librarians’ Association adopted a position statement in 2009 opposing book levelling practices as inconsistent with the values of teacher-librarians, as inhibiting “the use of authentic strategies for selection,” and as contradicting “the message of pursuing reading for the interest and passion it inspires” (“BCTLA Position Statement: Book Levelling and School Library Collections,” 2009, available at URL <http://bctf.ca/bctla/pub/documents/BookLevellingandSchoolLibraryCollections.pdf>).

Two immediate questions are prompted by book levelling: How widespread are these arbitrary, simplistic practices in the K-12 sector across Canada? And how can institutional transparency, staff consultation and due process, and overall accountability be ensured and safeguarded not only for students but for library and teaching personnel as well?

The goals of CLA's *Annual Challenges Survey* are to document objections to materials and policies in publicly-funded Canadian libraries, in order to educate the Canadian public about library collection management and free expression principles; to inform the Association's policy and advocacy work for intellectual freedom; and to help library staff approach difficult issues surrounding uncensored library access in a professional and methodical manner.

It is vitally important to share survey findings with all Canadians, as well as with professional colleagues, on how challenges are handled and resolved, particularly those instances in which materials are withdrawn from library collections or library access principles are revised. The Survey also provides an opportunity for publicly funded libraries to demonstrate their accountability to users and customers, stakeholders, elected officials, and the general public. The *Annual Challenges Survey* was inspired by two precursors, the Edmonton Public Library's challenged materials spreadsheet, and the confidential database maintained since 1990 by the ALA, whose online challenge reporting form can be found at <http://www.ala.org/ala/issuesadvocacy/banned/challengeslibrarymaterials/challengereporting/onlinechallengeform/index.cfm>.

As we have implored in previous reports, the Committee encourages all librarians and library administrators working in all publicly funded library sectors to contribute data to future surveys when they experience resource or policy challenges. Two school libraries reported challenges in the 2014 survey, and it is hard to believe they were the only ones that experienced resource complaints out of all 14,000 or so school libraries across Canada. Many large urban public libraries also do not contribute data, even though it is likely that at least some of them experience challenges on a fairly regular basis.

The Committee also strongly encourages the adoption of the practice of publicly releasing an annual listing of the challenges received. In recent years only three Canadian institutions are known to do so on a regular basis, Toronto Public Library, Ottawa Public Library, and Edmonton Public Library, examples of one way in which they communicate public accountability and institutional transparency.

The Committee wishes to reiterate, however, as we have in previous reports, that local institutions are not identified in any way in our survey reports or publicly accessible documents. This conforms with a 2011 CLA Executive Council policy endorsement of confidentiality of information identifying individual institutions and municipalities. Identifying data are collected only for statistical purposes, verification of authenticity, and follow-up with reporting agencies when needed. Permissible geographic and

jurisdictional disclosures are as follows: province or territory; type of institution (school, post-secondary, public, etc.); and type of complainant.

The *Annual Challenges Survey* is a voluntary survey, so readers are cautioned that the self-reports described here represent a subset of challenges actually occurring every year. In fact, the American Library Association (ALA) has estimated that there may be as many as four or five unreported challenges for every challenge that is reported to them (“Frequently Challenged Books,” Office for Intellectual Freedom, on ALA’s website, <http://www.ala.org/advocacy/banned/frequentlychallenged>; <http://librarianinblack.net/librarianinblack/2011/03/bookchallenges.html>). This under-reportage phenomenon is thought to be as great or greater in Canada. The best we can say is that the snapshots developed through the *Annual Challenges Survey* are incomplete but at least indicative.

Survey results since 2006 are widely shared with the Canadian public, CLA membership, other library workers and advocates, the Freedom of Expression Committee of the Book and Periodical Council, its annual Freedom to Read Week Kit, the Office of Intellectual Freedom of the American Library Association (ALA OIF), and the Freedom of Access to Information and Freedom of Expression Committee of the International Federation of Library Associations and Institutions (IFLA FAIFE). The annual reports and databases of challenged titles and policies can be accessed on the CLA website at http://www.cla.ca/Content/NavigationMenu/Resources/Resources/CLA_Challenges_Surve.htm.

** Alvin M. Schrader and Donna Bowman are colleagues on the Canadian Library Association's Intellectual Freedom Advisory Committee*

List of Challenges to Resources and Policies In Publicly-Funded Canadian Libraries and Schools, 2014

Challenges are listed alphabetically, categorized by number of challenges per item. Note that slightly corrected bibliographic data are recorded here from what was originally found in press reports or supplied by library officials who contributed to the 2014 CLA challenges survey. *Thanks to the library administrators and other stakeholders* who participated in the 2014 survey.

Series – 1 challenge each:

Gangsta, by Kawase Kohske (6 titles in graphic novel series)

- reasons: age inappropriate, too violent and sexually explicit for teens (BC)

I Don't Like You at All, Big Brother, by Kusano Kouichi (8 titles in graphic novel series)

- reasons: age inappropriate, sexually explicit (AB)

Oreimo, by Tsukasa Fushimi and Sakura Ikeda (4 titles in early reader graphic novel series)

- reasons: age inappropriate, sexually explicit (AB)

Paradise Lost Trilogy, DVD, dirs. Joe Berlinger and Bruce Sinofsky (3 titles *Paradise Lost: The Child Murders at Robin Hood Hills, Paradise Lost 2: Revelations, Paradise Lost 3: Purgatory*)

- reasons: sexually explicit, violence, nudity (Crime scene police footage showing graphically small children sexually mutilated) (ON)

Vampire Cheerleaders, by Adam Arnold, Michael Shelfer, and Shiei (5 titles in graphic novel series)

- reasons: age inappropriate, sexually explicit (AB)

Individual items – 1 challenge each:

3D Printing, by Kevin Roebuck

- reasons: inaccuracy (Compilation of Wikipedia articles and therefore dubious) (AB)

Abduction of Eden DVD, dir. Megan Griffiths

- reasons: sexually explicit, violence (Mature and upsetting material) (ON)

Antichrist, DVD, dir. Lars Von Trier

- reasons: sexually explicit, violence, nudity (Too disturbing) (BC)

The Armenian File: The Myth of Innocence Exposed, by Kamuran Gurun

- reasons: anti-ethnicity, inaccuracy, insensitivity, political viewpoint (Genocide denial is hateful and disturbing, and troubling to be included in a “genocide collection”) (QC)

The Armenian Massacres in Ottoman Turkey: A Disputed Genocide, by Guenter Lewy

- reasons: anti-ethnicity, inaccuracy, insensitivity, political viewpoint (Genocide denial is hateful and disturbing, and troubling to be included in a “genocide collection”) (QC)

An Armenian Source: Hovhannes Katchaznoui, by Tuirkkaya Ataoiv

- reasons: anti-ethnicity, inaccuracy, insensitivity, political viewpoint (Genocide denial is hateful and disturbing, and troubling to be included in a “genocide collection”) (QC)

Battle Bunny, by Jon Scieszka, ill. Max Barnett

- reasons: age inappropriate, violence (Not humorous and 10 year old was traumatized by the ‘exceedingly violent actions’ of the bunny) (QC)

Battle Queen 2020, DVD, dir. Daniel D’Or

- reasons: nudity (Sub-par below standards for library purchase) (ON)

Birth of a Nation, DVD, dir. D.W. Griffith

- reasons: racism (ON)

Black Butterflies, DVD, dir. Paula van der Oest

- reasons: violence, abortion, insensitivity (Subject of abortion unsettling and a disturbance to decency) (ON)

Camp Harlow, DVD, dir. Shane Hawks

- reasons: religious viewpoint (Packaging does not reflect Christian/Baptist religion) (ON)

The Card Player, DVD, dir. Dario Argento

- reasons: violence (BC)

Cheng Shi Zhen Quing Hui Ben [no author]

- reasons: inaccuracy (grammatical errors making it difficult for children to follow and to improve language skills) (ON)

- Claim Me*, by J. Kenner
- reasons: age inappropriate, inappropriate for any age, offensive language, sexually explicit (ON)
- Compliance*, DVD, dir. Craig Zobel
- reasons: sexism (People depicted as stupid, women as compliant, men as facilitating sexual abuse, no one punished) (ON)
- Daisy: A Hen into the Wild*, DVD, dir. Oh Sung-Yoon
- reasons: age inappropriate, violence (Upsetting story line) (ON)
- Daniel Half Human*, by David Chotjewitz, tr. Doris Orgel
- reasons: sexually explicit (Girls' breasts described gratuitously – too graphic for 15 year old boys) (QC)
- Donovan's Big Day*, by Lesléa Newman, ill. Mike Dutton
- reasons: age inappropriate, homosexuality (AB)
- Downloading Nancy*, DVD, dir. Johan Renck
- reasons: violence, inappropriate for any age (Too explicit for a public library collection) (BC)
- Footnotes in Gaza*, by Joe Sacco
- reasons: age inappropriate, political viewpoint, violence (Presented one-sided view of Gaza Strip conflict) (NS)
- Gangster Squad*, DVD, dir. Ruben Fleischer
- reasons: violence (ON)
- Gilgamesh*, by Andrew Winegarner
- reasons: age inappropriate, nudity (Shelved in children's area by mistake) (BC)
- Ike's Last Battle: The Battle of the Ruhr Pocket April 1945*, by Charles Whiting
- reasons: inaccuracy (Disagreed with allegation of Eisenhower love affair during war) (ON)
- Lili se fait piéger sur Internet*, by Dominique de Saint Mars (1 title in a graphic novel series)
- reasons: age inappropriate, sexually explicit, nudity ("Lili accidentally opens pornography and wonders what she's seeing; parent concern about child's ability to understand") (QC)
- Longarm and the Coldest Town in Hell*, by Tabor Evans (1 title #427 in adult fiction Longarm Series)
- reasons: sexually explicit (ON)
- Maxim Magazine issue*
- reasons: sexually explicit (AB)
- Mennonite Is the Name – Evil and Deception Are the Game: An Autobiography*, by Heidi Loewen
- reasons: false and defamatory content (BC)
- Miss Mousie's Blind Date*, by Tim Beiser
- reasons: insensitivity (Promotes negative body image) (ON)
- Monkey Mind: A Memoir of Anxiety*, audiobook, by Daniel Smith
- reasons: dark adult content (Cover should indicate the dark adult content) (AB)
- Music for Elementary Classroom Teachers*, by Charles Hoffer
- reasons: offensive language (Outdated language of 'mentally retarded') (AB)
- My Book of Life by Angel*, by Martine Leavitt
- reasons: age inappropriate, sexually explicit (Too graphic for young teenagers) (ON)
- The Nazi Occult*, by Kenneth Hite, ill. Darren Tan
- reasons: age inappropriate, occult, Satanism (Graphic novel could be potentially dangerous to vulnerable minds for mixing Nazism and occult) (SK)
- Newlyweeds*, DVD, dir. Shaka King
- reasons: offensive language, obscenity (There is plenty of degrading material around and this is too much – "F" word and other obscenities in first 10 minutes) (SK)
- A Not So Model Home*, by David James
- reasons: homosexuality (Cover does not mention homosexuality is present in novel) (ON)
- Nuts Sisters (Volume 2)*, by You-xian Lai
- reasons: age inappropriate (Inappropriate for teens as it Includes sexual references) (AB)
- Our Petroleum Challenge: Exploring Canada's Oil and Gas Industry*, by Robert Bott
- reasons: political viewpoint (Propaganda apologia for the tar sands industry) (BC)
- The Perks of Being a Wallflower*, by Stephen Chbosky
- reasons: age inappropriate, offensive language, sexually explicit, violence, suicide (Should be banned from curriculum for graphic pornographic conversation, vulgar, masturbation instructions, bestiality) (BC)

- The Perks of Being a Wallflower*, DVD, dir. Stephen Chbosky
- reasons: age inappropriate, offensive language, sexually explicit, violence, suicide (Should be banned from curriculum for graphic pornographic conversation, vulgar, masturbation instructions, bestiality) (BC)
- Post Tenebras Lux*, dir. Carlos Reygadas
- reasons: nudity (ON)
- Qu'est-ce que vous faites la?*, by Dominique Jolin
- reasons: age inappropriate (Objection in children's book to depictions of busy work-at-home mother leaving children to look after themselves during the day and getting into mischief, and to children walking into mother's bedroom at night to ask mother and boyfriend "what are you doing?") (BC)
- Red Road*, DVD, dir. Andrea Arnold
- reasons: sexually explicit (Not in good taste) (ON)
- Shui Na Zou Wo De Liu Liu Qiu*, by Melhua Lee
- reasons: inaccuracy (grammatical errors making it difficult for children to follow and to improve language skills) (ON)
- A Single Man*, DVD, dir. Tom Ford
- reasons: homosexuality (Homosexual lifestyle content) (ON)
- Sleeping Dragons All Around*, by Sheree Fitch; ill. Michele Nidenoff
- reasons: racism, stereotyping (Perpetuates negative Chinese stereotypes, reducing a people to a funny character as merely tokenism is unacceptable) (SK)
- Snow Angels*, DVD, dir. David Gordon Green
- reasons: violence, suicide (BC)
- Sri Guru Granth Sahib* (English tr.), by Gurbachan Singh Talib in consultation with Bhai Jodh Singh
- reasons: religious viewpoint (Considered sacred text to be placed in a separate revered location) (AB)
- Summer Moon*, by Jan DeLima
- reasons: age inappropriate, inappropriate for any age, sexually explicit (Passionate scenes not suitable for young readers) (AB)
- Ted*, DVD, dir. Seth McFarlane
- reasons: offensive language, sexually explicit, drugs/drug use (Staff should monitor borrowers) (ON)
- Teeth*, by Hannah Moskowitz
- reasons: offensive language, religious viewpoint (Low standard, explicit language and blasphemous) (ON)
- Tough Sh*t: Life Advice from a Fat, Lazy Slob Who Did Good*, audiobook, by Kevin Smith
- reasons: offensive language, sexually explicit, pornography (Customer thought it was a self-help book) (ON)
- Veggie Tales* (1 title of a long children's picture book series)
- reasons: religious viewpoint ("It spreads Christian propaganda") (BC)
- Wake in Fright*, DVD, dir. Ted Kotcheff
- reasons: depiction of animal cruelty (AB)
- Wallace and Gromit: A Matter of Loaf and Death*, DVD
- reasons: age inappropriate (ON)
- The Wedding Pact*, (DVD), dir. Matt Berman
- reasons: sexually explicit, drugs/drug use, violence, offensive language (Drinking and driving under the influence) (SK)
- Wherever Nina Lies*, by Lynn Weingarten
- reasons: age inappropriate, offensive language, sexually explicit (Lots of swearing, under-age drinking, sex) (BC)
- The Wolf of Wall Street*, DVD, dir. Martin Scorsese
- reasons: nudity, sexism, drugs/drug use (Offensive including depiction of women) (ON)
- Zheng Jiu Wang Yin Shao Nian*, by Huafang Cui
- reasons: religious viewpoint, political viewpoint (Misleading negative inclusion in parental guide to the Internet of material inspiring hatred against Falun Gong by claiming a child threatened suicide in accordance with Falun Gong website teachings) (ON)

Policy challenges:

Home delivery – library membership card policy for people with disabilities in a British Columbia public library
Borrowing policy to have parents monitor their children’s borrowing – linked to individually challenged picture book *Veggie Tales* in a British Columbia public library

Request for Reconsideration form questions and CLA Intellectual Freedom policy – tangentially linked to individually challenged title *Our Petroleum Challenge* in a British Columbia public library

Code of Ethics, Statement of Intellectual Freedom, and Unacceptable Behavior policies – monitoring students’ computer use and imposing time limits and preserving confidentiality of library staff names and addresses in an Alberta public library

Unfiltered children’s Internet access policy, Patron Access to Electronic Information Resources policy, Unattended Children in the Library policy, and CLA Internet Access policy in an Alberta public library

Collection policy (massive “levelling”) in a high school library and classrooms involving indiscriminate weeding of materials deemed outdated or inappropriate, especially everything about the former USSR or the Aboriginal collection because of titles containing the word Indian or Eskimo

Collection policy (massive “levelling”) in an elementary school library and classrooms involving indiscriminate weeding of materials deemed irrelevant to the provincial curriculum

Classification policy on Nazi occult material in a Saskatchewan public library – linked to individually challenged graphic novel title *The Nazi Occult*

Classification policy on juvenile collection in an Ontario public library – linked to individually challenged title *Teeth*

DVD ratings policy in a British Columbia public library – linked to individually challenged DVD *Antichrist*

DVD ratings policy in a Saskatchewan public library – linked to individually challenged DVD *The Wedding Pact*

DVD ratings policy in an Ontario public library – linked to individually challenged DVD *Post Tenebras Lux*

DVD ratings policy in an Ontario public library – linked to individually challenged DVD *A Single Man*

DVD ratings policy in an Ontario public library – linked to individually challenged DVD *Wallace and Gromit: A Matter of Loaf and Death*

DVD ratings policy and patron monitoring (patron privacy) policy in an Ontario public library – linked to individually challenged DVD *Ted*

Labelling policy in a British Columbia public library – linked to individually challenged DVD *Snow Angels*

Labelling policy in a British Columbia public library – linked to individually challenged adult graphic novel *Gilgamesh*

Labelling policy in an Alberta public library – linked to individually challenged audiobook *Monkey Mind: A Memoir of Anxiety*

Labelling policy in an Ontario public library – linked to individually challenged DVD *Camp Harlow*

Labelling policy in an Ontario public library – linked to individually challenged audiobook *Tough Sh*t: Life Advice from a Fat, Lazy Slob Who Did Good*

List of Challenges to Resources and Policies Reported by Publicly-Funded Canadian Libraries, 2014

	Material type	Title/Policy	Reason	Complainant	Library type	Response	P / T	Challenge & resolution dates
1	Graphic novel/ Comic/ Manga; adult	The Nazi Occult by Kenneth Hite, ill. by Darren Tan	Occult Satanism Age inappropriate Patron felt the graphic novel could attract young adults to the mix of Nazism and occult and could be potentially dangerous to the vulnerable minds. Requested removal or at least relocation.	Patron	Public	Material retained	S K	June 20; Resolution Letter sent: September 17, 2014
2	Film/DVD Rated R in U.S. (Motion Picture Assoc. of America – MPAA)	Newlyweeds; Shaka King Director/Writer and Jim Wareck Producer	Offensive language Obscenity Patron reported that the first 10 minutes of the film are full of the "F" word and other obscenities. Patron stated that there is plenty of degrading material around and this is too much.	Patron	Public	Material retained	S K	April 22; Ca May 2014
3	Film/DVD unrated in U.S., unrated in Canada	The Wedding Pact; starring Haylie Duff, dir. by Matt Berman	Sexually explicit Drugs/drug use Violence Offensive language Drinking and driving under the influence. Patron requested removal or rating of the movie to be changed from General.	Patron	Public	Material retained	S K	October 31; Resolution letter sent to patron on November 26, 2014
4	Book/ Textbook; children's picture book	Sleeping [Dragons] All Around, Sheree Fitch; Illustrated by Michele Nidenoff	Racism Stereotyping Patron felt it would perpetuate negative stereotypes of Chinese people, the language(s) and culture. Reducing a people to a funny character in a story is not acceptable given there is merely tokenism.	Patron	Public	Material retained	S K	February 12; Patron letter sent on March 25, 2014
5 6 7 8 9 10	Graphic novel/ Comic/ Manga; for mature audiences	Gangsta (graphic novel series), by Kawase Kohske	Age inappropriate [Violence] [Sexually explicit] "Too violent and sexually explicit for teen collection."	Patron	Public	Material relocated/reclassified Graphic novel series relocated to adult collection	B C	December 15; Resolved December 30, 2014
1 1 1 2 1 3 1 4 1 5 1 6 1 7 1 8	Graphic novel/ Comic/ Manga; adult (YA in Japan)	I Don't Like You at all, Big Brother, by Kusano Kouichi series	Sexually explicit Age inappropriate	Patron	Public	Material relocated/reclassified Series retained in collection but moved from Teen collection to Adult Graphic Novel collection	A B	Jan 16; Resolved: Feb 7 2014
1 9 2 2 1 2 2 2 3	Graphic novel/ Comic/ Manga; (adult)	Vampire Cheerleaders by Adam Arnold, Michael Shelfer, and Shiei series	Sexually explicit Age inappropriate	Patron	Public	Material relocated/reclassified. Series retained in collection but moved from Teen collection to Adult Graphic Novel collection.	A B	Jan 16; Resolved: Feb 7 2014
2 4	Graphic novel/ Comic/	Oreimo, by Tsukasa Fushimi and Sakura	Sexually explicit Age inappropriate	Patron	Public	Material relocated/reclassified. Series retained in collection but	A B	Jan 16; Resolved:

2 5 2 6 2 7	Manga; (adult)	Ikeda series				moved from Teen collection to Adult Graphic Novel collection.		Feb 7 2014
2 8	Magazine/ Journal	Maxim Magazine, Dennis Maxim Inc.	Sexually explicit	Patron	Public	Material retained	A B	May 7; Resolved: May 7 2014
2 9	Book/ Textbook; children's picture book	Donovan's Big Day by Lesléa Newman, ill. by Mike Dutton	Age inappropriate [Homosexuality]	Patron	Public	Material retained	A B	Aug 28; Resolved: Aug 28 2014
3 0	Book/ Textbook; [YA?]	Nuts Sisters, Volume 2 by Lai, You-xian [Chinese title for YA?]	Age inappropriate This book is not appropriate for teens as it includes sexual references	Patron	Public	Material relocated/reclassified. Moved from Children's collection to Teen Chinese collection.	A B	Sept 3; resolved: Sept 3 2014
3 1	Book/ Textbook; adult non-fiction	3D Printing by Kevin Roebuck	Inaccuracy Book content was a compilation of Wikipedia articles and therefore the information was dubious	Patron	Public	Material removed	A B	Oct 8; resolved: Oct 8 2014
3 2	Film/DVD; rated R in U.S.	Wake in Fright by Image Entertainment, Drafthouse Films, directed by Ted Kotcheff	Depiction of animal cruelty	Patron	Public	Material retained	A B	Sept 3; Resolved: Sept 3 2014
3 3	Audio-book; adult non-fiction	Monkey Mind: A Memoir of Anxiety – Audiobook by Daniel Swift	Dark adult content The cover should include a caveat on the cover indicating the dark adult content contained therein	Patron	Public	Material retained	A B	Nov 3; Resolved: Nov 3 2014
3 4	Book/ Textbook, adult novel	Summer Moon by Jan DeLima	Age inappropriate [Sexually explicit] [Inappropriate for any age] Passionate scenes included in the book are not suitable for young readers	Patron	Public	Material retained	A B	Dec 19; Resolved: Dec 19 2014
3 5	Graphic novel/ Comic/ Manga; Graphic novel series Children's from France [illustrated early reader?]	Lili se fait piéger sur Internet de Dominique Saint-Mars, ill. by Serge Bloch	Nudity Sexually explicit Age inappropriate There is a scene where Lili unintentionally comes across pornography on the Internet and wonders what's happening in the images she sees. The cartoon images in the book depict naked adults. The parent was concerned about the images in the book, and a child's ability to understand what was happening in the book.	K-12 school student Parent	Elementary school library	Parent made complaint to parents committee of the school. Material retained We kept the book in the collection, but encourage students to read it with a parent.	P Q	February 2014 and was resolved shortly thereafter
3 6	Book/ Textbook; Children's picture book	Battle Bunny by Jon Scieszka, ill. by Max Barnett	Age inappropriate Violence The parent did not find the book humorous. She said her 10 year old was "traumatised" by the "exceedingly violent" actions of the Bunny. She felt that many parents would share her opinion and requested that the book be removed from the collection.	Parent	Public	Material retained Steps taken: The book was evaluated by our librarians. We shared the opinion that the intent of the book was humour and satire. We felt that it might be particularly attractive to reluctant readers. Professional reviews were sought out. Very positive. Loan history reviewed: The book had been previously borrowed on four other occasions, without comment or complaint. Outcome: It was decided that the book would remain in the collection. A telephone message was left for the client, inviting her to discuss our decision. She did not call back.	P Q	May 18 challenge
3 7	Book/ Textbook; adult non-fiction	Music for elementary classroom teachers by Charles Hoffer (2005).	Offensive language In one chapter the author used outdated language: mentally retarded. A section heading in one chapter about helping children was labelled: The Mentally Retarded.	Teacher / faculty [Post-secondary instructor]	Academic	Material retained The instructor, in discussion with the librarian, indicated that the value of the content in the book far outweighed the use of an outdated phrase.	A B	January; Resolved January 2014.
3 8	Book/ Textbook, adult	Sri Guru Granth Sahib in English translation / by	[Religious viewpoint]	Post-secondary	Academic	Material retained The student did not follow up for	A B	February; Resolved

	non-fiction	Gurbachan Singh Talib in consultation with Bhai Jodh Singh (1995); Four volume English translation of the central religious text of Sikhism.	One student felt that this should not be shelved in the Main Collection of materials as it is considered a sacred text. The student felt it should be placed in a separate, revered location. The Collections Librarian discussed this with faculty in the Religious Studies department after talking to the student. This particular text is not an original Guru Granth Sahib. It is an academic text with English translations and was not the same as the original official versions, which must be made with the strict code of conduct.	student		discussion.		February 2014.
39	Graphic novel/ Comic/ Manga, adult/ mature	Gilgamesh, a graphic novel by Andrew Winegarner	Nudity Age inappropriate Customer thought this was a children's book but it was actually classified as adult level. Customer wanted a label on the cover of the book with the following wording "Explicit - Parental Advisory"	Patron	Public	Material retained The cover of this book looks 'juvenile' but it is classified as adult. It could have been filed in the children's area by mistake. The title was retained in the library and staff were cautioned to be careful with shelving of materials	B C	April 13; letter sent to customer April 28, 2014
40	Book/ Textbook, adult non-fiction	Our Petroleum Challenge: exploring Canada's oil and gas industry by Robert Bott; Petroleum Communication Foundation	Political viewpoint Customer felt this document was "an apologia for the tar sands industry" and that such propaganda should not be circulated by a public library	Patron	Public	Other The document in question couldn't be found and was not in our catalogue. We suspect that this document was either an unsolicited item that staff put on the give-away table or was left by another customer. We wrote to the complaining customer that the publication was not in our catalogue but we did refer him to the CLA Freedom of Information statement and explained that we do try to represent all points of view.	B C	September 4; Letter sent approximately September 20, 2014
41	Film/DVD, unrated in Canada or US	Downloading Nancy, directed by Johan Renck, Strand Releasing	Violence [Inappropriate for any age] Customer felt this DVD was too explicit for a public library collection	Patron	Public	Material retained letter was sent to the customer explaining our collection policy and that this title is classified as adult and warning does appear on the cover.	B C	April 22; Letter sent to customer - May 13, 2014
4244	Book/ Textbook; adult non-fiction	The Armenian file: the myth of innocence exposed (K.Gurun); The Armenian massacres in Ottoman Turkey: a disputed genocide (G.Lewy); An Armenian source: Hovhannes Katchaznoui (T.Ataov)	Anti-ethnicity Inaccuracy Insensitivity Political viewpoint Hateful The complainant found them to be "hateful and disturbing" in their denial of genocide events. The books are contained in the Libraries' "Jonassohn Genocide Collection". The books are generally believed to be inaccurate and intended to deny the occurrence of genocide. The complainant was especially troubled by the inclusion of such books in a "Genocide Collection".	University professor	Academic	Material retained. An explanation was provided to the complainant that the books, even though "deemed offensive", fall within the mandate of the collection, which is to provide comprehensive resources for research, including resources that may be beyond what is "culturally acceptable", in order to show the full range of information and debate surrounding an event or issue.	P Q	January 6; Resolved January 07 2014
44	Book/Textbook; YA novel	Daniel half human; David Chotjewitz (Author), Doris Orgel (Translator)	Sexually explicit Girls' breasts described gratuitously. Thought to be too graphic for our 15 year old boys.	Parent/guardian	K-12 school library	Material removed Parents dictating to school and admin backing down.	P Q	Jan 20; Feb 20 resolved
45	Film/DVD, rated 14A in Canada, rated R by MPAA	"Ted", directed by Seth McFarlane, Universal Pictures	Offensive language Drugs/drug use Sexually explicit Patron requested monitoring by library staff as to who is borrowing this item (e.g., children)	Patron	Public	Material retained The DVD was not added to the "restricted" collection, as its rating is 14A. Our "restricted" collection is for 18A and R-rated movies only.	O N	Jan 23; Resolved February 24, 2014
46	Book/ Textbook, YA novel	"My Book of Life by Angel", by Martine Leavitt	Age inappropriate [Sexually explicit] Patron said that the book was "too graphic" for a young teenager and asked that it be moved to the adult collection	Patron	Public	Material retained Material was retained in the young adult collection	O N	March 12, 2014 Resolved: April 14, 2014
47	Book/ Textbook;	Miss Mousie's Blind Date, by Tim Beiser	Insensitivity Challenger claimed that the book promoted negative	Library staff	Public	Material retained	O N	March 19; Resolved

	Children's picture book		body image Challenger claimed that the book had a theme of negative body image and asked that it be removed from the collection.	member				April 16, 2014
48	Film/DVD; adult unrated	The Card Player produced by Dario Argento, Starz/Anchor Bay	Violence	Patron	Public	Material retained	B C	July 31, 2014
49	Film/DVD; adult rated R in U.S., 14 and over in Canada	Gangster squad, Warner Bros.; Ruben Fleischer, director; Will Beall, writer; Dan Lin, Kevin McCormick, Michael Tadross, producers	Violence Excessive violence.	Patron	Public	Material retained	O N	January; January 2014
50	Book/ Textbook; adult fiction	"A not so model home" by David James (An Amanda Thorne Mystery)	Homosexuality Cover of book does not clarify that homosexuality is present in story.	Patron	Public	Material retained	O N	March; March 2014
51	Book/ textbook; adult non-fiction	Ike's last battle: the battle of the Ruhr Pocket April 1945, by Charles Whiting	Inaccuracy Disagreed with allegation of Eisenhower's love affair during war	Patron	Public	Material retained	O N	April; April 2014
52	Film/DVD; R rated in both Canada and U.S.	Battle Queen 2020, written by William D. Bostjancic, Michael B. Druxman et al.; directed by Daniel D'Or	Nudity Poor movie, below standards for library. Questioned why library would purchase a sub-par movie.	Library staff member	Public	Material retained	O N	May; May 2014
53	Film/DVD; Rated R in U.S.; unrated in Canada	Abduction of Eden, Phase 4 Films presents a Centripetal Films production; produced by Colin Harper Plank, Jacob Mosler; story by Richard B. Phillips, Chong Kim; screenplay by Richard B. Phillips, Megan Griffiths; directed by Megan Griffiths	Sexually explicit Violence Mature and upsetting material in movie.	Patron	Public	Material retained	O N	July; July 2014
54	Film/DVD, rated R in U.S., unrated in Canada	The Wolf of Wall Street, a Paramount release presented with Red Granite Pictures of an Appian Way/Sikelia/Emjag production; produced by Martin Scorsese, Leonardo DiCaprio, Riza Aziz, Joey McFarland, Emma Koskoff; written by Terence Winter; directed by Martin Scorsese	Sexism Nudity Drugs/drug use Found movie offensive, including the depiction of women.	Patron	Public	Material retained	O N	July; July 2014
55	Film/DVD; animated film unrated in U.S. or Canada; looks family	Daisy: a hen into the wild, a Odolgti production; Myung Films and Lotte Entertainment in association with GDCA and Sovik Venture Capital Co.; directed by Oh Sung-Yoon	Age inappropriate [Violence] Too violent for a children's movie, with an upsetting story line.	Library staff member	Public	Material retained	O N	December; December 2014
56	Book/ Textbook; adult fiction	Longarm Series [#427] – Longarm and the Coldest Town in Hell by Tabor Evans	Sexually explicit	Patron	Public	Material retained	O N	December 2014
57	Book/ Textbook, adult non-fiction	Zheng Jiu Wang Yin Shao Nian by Huafang Cui; Chinese adult parental guide for children's safe use of the internet	Religious viewpoint Political viewpoint The Falun Dafa Association of [...] complained that a chapter in the book inspired hatred against the Falun Gong movement. The book contains a series of scenarios depicting the dangers of the internet for children. The chapter objected to concerns a child who tells his father he is	Interest group; Falun Dafa Association	Public	Material removed; [Material restricted] The Materials Review Committee found that the depiction of Falun Gong was negative at that the inclusion of this material in a parental guide to the internet was [...] misleading. The	O N	July 23; resolved Nov. 24, 2014

			going to commit suicide in accordance with the teachings of Falun Gong whose website he has been visiting unbeknownst to his parents.			circulating copies of the book were removed and a research copy retained for the Toronto Reference Library. The subject headings were changed to reflect the content.		
5 8 5 9	Book/ Textbook; Chinese children's picture books	Cheng Shi Zhen Quing Hui Ben [no author] and Shui Na Zou Wo De Liu Liu Qiu by Melhua Lee	Inaccuracy Grammatical errors in both books The customer wrote that there are grammatical errors in both books that make it difficult for children to follow the stories and improve their language skills.	Patron	Public	Material removed (Cheng Shi Zhen Qing Hui Ben) Material retained (Shui Na Zou Wo De Liu Liu Qiu) The books were reviewed by an external expert who found that Cheng Shi Zhen Qing Hui Ben did contain errors, which would make it difficult to comprehend. The book was withdrawn. She found the grammar in Shui Na Zou Wo De Liu Liu Qiu to be acceptable and it was retained.	O N	Sept. 13; resolved March 2, 2015
6 0	Film/DVD, unrated in Canada and U.S.	Camp Harlow, Aj Olson, Monique Hurd, actors; Shane Hawks, dir.	Religious viewpoint Packaging does not reflect the video's religious content concerning the Baptist church. There is nothing on the packaging that mentions the Christian/Baptist religion content in the video. The customer maintained that it was deceptive and violated OLA's Statement on the Rights of the Individual, "That the provision of library service to the public is based on the right of the citizen, under the protection of the law, to judge individually on questions of politics, religion and morality." She wanted it moved from the children's collection and labelled.	Patron	Public	Material relocated/reclassified We stated that there are many items in the collection promoting particular religious and spiritual beliefs and that this fulfills our mandate to provide "universal access to a broad range of human knowledge, information and ideas." However, we agreed that there was no indication of the film's Christian viewpoint and revised the description in the catalogue as we do not label items as to content. The video was transferred to the adult collection (there is no teen video collection) because the subject of a teenager's conversion to Christianity is a complex one more suited to the adult collection.	O N	Aug. 8; Oct. 30, 2014
6 1	Film/DVD; Rated R in U.S.; 14 A in Canada	Compliance; dir. Craig Zobel, Magnolia Pictures	Sexism Women are depicted as stupid and compliant and men as stupid and willing to facilitate sexual abuse. Also concern that no-one appears to have been punished. He [patron] also found it disturbing, implausible and was concerned that no-one was punished. He wanted it removed.	Patron	Public	Material retained Compliance is based on a true story depicting the abuse of a restaurant worker by her manager on the instructions of a phone caller posing as a policeman (the transcript of an ABC report on the incident was given to the customer). The film was well reviewed in general and was nominated for a number of independent film awards. Its inclusion in the collection reflects our mandate of providing a collection that meets the varied interests of the diverse Toronto public and it cannot be borrowed by anyone under the age of 14. It was retained in the adult collection.	O N	Feb. 21; resolved May 12, 2014
6 2	CD/Sound recording; adult non-fiction Audiobook with video content	Tough sh*t: Life Advice from a Fat, Lazy Slob Who Did Good, by Kevin Smith	Offensive language [Sexually explicit] Customer thought it was a self-help publication. Did not like the content (offensive language, "porn"). Wanted a warning label affixed.	Patron	Public	Material retained No warning label applied.	O N	Oct. 27; Resolved Nov. 5, 2014.
6 3	Graphic novel/ Comic/ Manga; adult non-fiction	Footnotes in Gaza, by Joe Sacco	Political viewpoint [Violence] [Age inappropriate] Patron complained that the book presented a one-sided view of the conflict in the Gaza Strip.	Patron	Public	Material relocated/reclassified. After discussion amongst managers and the patron it was decided that we would retain the material. The adult graphic novel	N S	August 5; Resolved on August 20th, 2014

			The patron felt that the graphic novel presented a one-sided view of the conflict in the Gaza Strip. Also felt that the violence depicted in the graphic novel should not be viewed by young children.			collection was moved in that branch in order to place it further away from the children/youth section of the library.		
64	Film/DVD; adult unrated	Birth of a Nation (DVD), dir. D.W. Griffith, starring Lillian Gish, Mae Marsh	Racism Patron felt the portrayal of blacks in the film was racist.	Patron	Public	Material retained While the portrayal of blacks in this film is racist, this film is considered a classic in cinematography and is the first example of filming techniques that formed the foundation for filming today. It also provides a window into a particular view and attitude that was present at the time it was filmed. Therefore from a research perspective the material was retained.	O N	Aug. 19, 2014
65	Book/Textbook Adult fiction	Claim Me, by J. Kenner, Bantam Paperback (2 nd in a trilogy)	Sexually explicit Offensive language Age inappropriate [Inappropriate for any age]	Patron	Public	Material retained	O N	September 11; November 5, 2014
66	Film/DVD; not rated [family]	Wallace and Gromit: A Matter of Loaf and Death	Age inappropriate Customer felt it was not appropriate for the juvenile collection	Patron	Public	Material retained DVD was retained in the juvenile collection after other libraries were checked for their collection placement	O N	April 28, 2014 was date of resolution
67	Film/DVD, unrated in U.S., OFRB rated 14A	Post Tenebras Lux; Strand Home Video; a film by Carlos Reygadas	Nudity	Patron	Public	Material retained OFRB rating of 14A retained. Good reviews factored in the evaluation	O N	December 18, 2013; January 29, 2014
68	Book/Textbook; YA fiction	Teeth, by Hannah Moskowitz	Offensive language [Religious viewpoint] Parent found the title of low standard, lacking warning for its explicit language, and blasphemous	Parent/guardian	Public	Material retained Reviews were consulted, other libraries checked, and reason given not to move the title out of teen	O N	November 19; Response: November, 2014
69	Film/DVD rated PG by OFRB; rated R in U.S.	A Single Man, dir. Tom Ford, starring Colin Firth and Julianne Moore	Homosexuality Objected to not being warned about homosexual lifestyle content	Patron	Public	Material retained We referred to OFRB rating of PG	O N	Dec. 31, 2013; Response: January 27, 2014
70	Book/Textbook; children's picture book	Veggie Tales (long series, but this seems to be a challenge to just one of them)	Religious viewpoint It spreads Christian propaganda	Parent	Public	Material retained Explained to patron that as a library we aim to have our collections reflect the diverse reading needs of the communities and individuals we serve, whether cultural, ethnic, or religious, and that we rely on parents to be involved in their children's use of the library, to reflect their own family's thoughts and values in their library selections	B C	Dec 12; Dec 22, 2014 -- email sent to patron
71	Book/Textbook; adult non-fiction	Mennonite Is the Name -- Evil and Deception Are the Game: An Autobiography, by Heidi Loewen	Allegations of false and defamatory content As above, allegations of false and defamatory content about an individual named in the book, which is an autobiography	Lawyer for an individual named in the book	Public	Material retained	B C	September 23; Resolved October 3, 2014.
72	Book/Textbook, YA novel; Film/DVD, not [?] rated in Canada [14A], PG13 in U.S.	The Perks of Being a Wallflower, by Stephen Chbosky, [book and movie]	Sexually explicit Suicide Violence Offensive language Age inappropriate pornographic; graphic pornographic conversation; vulgar; masturbation instructions; bestiality; offensive content; unsuitable for teens Parent wanted book banned, removed from the curriculum.	Parent/Guardian	K-12 School [not library]	[No final decision yet] Alternative book given to student to read, Son of Neptune by Rick Riordan. Student excused from viewing film version in class. Book is under review by school district.	B C	March 2014; Resolution decision unknown.

7 4	Film/DVD, rated R in U.S, 14 and over in Canada Home Video Rating.	Snow Angels, directed by David Gordon Green, starring Kate Beckinsale	Violence [Suicide] Patron objects to two scenes in particular: drowning of a young girl; execution of wife by husband, then husband's suicide. Patron requests either add a label warning of extreme violence to the dvd case, or remove the dvd from the collection.	Patron	Public	Material retained	B C	March 20; Reply sent: March 31, 2014
7 5	Book/ Textbook, YA novel	Wherever Nina Lies, by Lynn Weingarten	Age inappropriate [Offensive language] [Sexually explicit] Patron says: "Lots of swearing, under-age drinking, sex."	Patron	Public	Material relocated/reclassified Reviewers such as Booklist and Kirkus Reviews recommended for teen readers; title was improperly catalogued as a children's book - therefore it was relocated to the teen collection.	B C	March 27; Reply sent: April 25, 2014
7 6	Film/DVD, unrated by MPAA [adult]	Antichrist, directed by Lars Von Trier, starring Willem Dafoe	Nudity Sexually explicit Violence Patron says "too...disturbing"; requests it be rated for 19 years and older	Patron	Public	Material relocated/reclassified No rating assigned by MPA- Canada to edition owned by library; however, Consumer Protection BC rated theatrical release as Restricted. [...] PL's policy is, in cases where an unrated film with explicit content is identified AND there is a BC rating, the library will move the film to the Restricted films collection. For this reason, the dvd was relocated to the Restricted collection, in which Restricted films may be borrowed by patrons 18 years and older.	B C	July 25; Reply sent: Aug. 1, 2014
7 7	Book/ Textbook; children's picture book	Qu'est-ce que vous faites là?, by Dominique Jolin	Age inappropriate Patron objects to depiction of busy work-at-home mother leaving children to look after themselves during the day and getting into mischief, as well as depiction of children walking into mother's bedroom at night to ask mother and boyfriend "what are you doing?" Patron says "Not appropriate. Remove from circulation."	Patron	Public	Material retained Book retained in children's French picture book collection: book was written for preschoolers, and the author is well-known for her child-centred, humorous stories.	B C	Nov. 9; Reply sent: Dec. 5, 2014
7 8 7 9 8 0	Film/DVD; unrated in U.S. or Canada	Paradise Lost Trilogy / Docurama Films, 2012; a collection of 3 documentary films produced by HBO and Docurama; [Paradise Lost: The Child Murders at Robin Hood Hills; Paradise Lost 2: Revelations; Paradise Lost 3: Purgatory]; Joe Berlinger, Bruce Sinofsky, dirs.	Nudity Violence [Sexually explicit] DVD graphically shows small children sexually mutilated (actual police footage from crime scene).	Patron	Public	[Material labelled] DVD is unrated. A warning label was added to items and catalogue record, informing patrons of the graphic content.	O N	August 19; resolved August 21, 2014
8 1	Film/DVD; [adult unrated in U.S.]; 18A in Canada	Red Road – Tartan Video 2006; Kate Dickie, Tony Curran, actors; Andrea Arnold, dir. and writer	Sexually explicit Film contains explicit sex scenes, not in good taste.	Patron	Public	Material retained Film is rated 18A by Canadian Home Video Rating system, Cannes Jury Prize winner, many circulations. Patrons are already restricted from borrowing according to age, based on film rating	O N	October 27; resolved October 27, 2014
8 2	Film/DVD; rated 14A by Ontario Film Board, rated R in U.S.	Black Butterflies, New Video, 2012, dir. Paula van der Oest	Violence Abortion Insensitivity Graphic and offensive, subject of abortion unsettling "a disturbance to decency."	Patron	Public	Material retained Film is rated 14A by Ontario Film Review Board, and is labelled appropriately. Received many positive reviews and many circulations.	O N	October 7; resolved October 7, 2014

Policy Challenges

P 1	Location/classification policy	Policy on location of items in collection related to challenge to The Nazi Occult	Occult Satanism Age inappropriate Patron felt the graphic novel could attract young adults to the mix of Nazism and occult and could be potentially dangerous to the vulnerable minds. Requested removal or at least relocation	Patron	Public	Policy retained	S K	June 20, 2014 Letter sent: September 17, 2014
P 2	Film ratings policy	Policy on rating films related to challenge to "The Wedding Pact"	Sexually explicit Drugs/drug use Violence Offensive language Drinking and driving under the influence Patron requested removal or rating of the movie to be changed from General.	Patron	Public	Policy retained	S K	October 31; letter sent to patron on November 26, 2014
P 3	Labelling policy	Policy on not labelling content connected to challenge of audiobook Monkey Mind	Dark adult content The cover should include a caveat on the cover indicating the dark adult content contained therein	Patron	Public	Policy retained	A B	Nov 3; Resolved: Nov 3 2014
P 4 P 5 P 6	Library policies on ethics and privacy, intellectual freedom, and behaviour	Code of Ethics, Statement of Intellectual Freedom, and our Unacceptable Behavior in the Library Policy	A teacher from a local foster group home came in demanding the names and addresses of all library staff, so that they may be held accountable for the kids skipping school and using the library's computers all day. This was followed up by a visit from the home's manager asking that we make the kids leave after a certain amount of time, send them home for meals and monitor their internet use. Essentially we are being asked to parent the children in the home's care. The actual request to change our policy to suit the needs of the foster home's employees and administrator came from the home's manager. She felt that our policies caused the kids to skip school. If our policies were changed to monitor the computer activity of the children (all above the age of 12) then the kids would not skip school.	Foster home manager	Public	Policies retained I brought the situation to the board's attention. They did not see the need to amend the policy, and they felt that I had handled the situation correctly. The home, school principal, and the home's regional supervisor continue to send emails requesting to meet to discuss changes. The board has declined to meet with them.	A B	Nov. 11 - ongoing
P 7 P 8 P 9	Internet access related policies, unattended children policy	The challenge was the library offering unfiltered internet access. The policies challenged were: Patron Access to Electronic Information Resources Policy, Unattended Children in the Library Policy, and the CLA Statement on Internet Access	[Sexually explicit] [Age inappropriate] A seven year-old used the library's computer near the school-aged book collections. These computers have recommended resources, but it is possible to exit to the open web. At some point the child told his mother that he saw something disturbing on these computers. The patron wanted internet access on all computers in the library to be filtered, or at least internet access to be removed from the school-ages computers to prevent accidental access to pornography	Parent/ Guardian(mother of 7 year old)	Public	Policies retained The patron made a presentation to the Library Board. The Board made no changes to the library's policies, and referred to matter back to the CEO to address on an operational level. Operationally, we printed placed signs at the school-aged computer stations explaining that there is access to the open web that parents are responsible for their children's use of the Internet and that recommended resources are available. We reduced the amount of time that a computer in this area is idle before the session is logged off so that the log-on acceptance agreement is visible more frequently on the screens. As well, we printed copies of the acceptance agreement that appears on each computer when logging in, and posted these as signed by the computer stations.	A B	November 4; Date of last activity: December 5, 2014
P 10	Labelling policy	Policy of not labelling content of materials linked to challenge to graphic novel Gilgamesh	Nudity Age inappropriate Customer thought this was a children's book but it was actually classified as adult level. Customer wanted a label on the cover of the book with the following wording "Explicit - Parental Advisory"	Patron	Public	Policy retained	B C	April 13; letter sent to customer April 28, 2014

P 1 1	Reconsideration policy	This is partly a policy challenge linked to challenge to Our Petroleum Challenge as the customer took exception to our Request for Reconsideration procedures. He felt our form did not allow him to express his concerns.	He felt our form did not allow him to express his concerns	Patron	Public	Policy/form revised – modified - This challenge did cause us to review the form and simplify the questions and leave more leeway for customers to express their concerns without having to choose categories etc.	B C	September 4; Letter sent approximately September 20, 2014
P 1 2	Intellectual freedom policy	CLA Freedom of Information statement, linked to challenge to Our Petroleum Challenge	Customer felt this document was "an apologia for the tar sands industry" and that such propaganda should not be circulated by a public library	Patron	Public	Policy retained The document in question couldn't be found and was not in our catalogue. We suspect that this document was either an unsolicited item that staff put on the give-away table or was left by another customer. We wrote to the complaining customer that the publication was not in our catalogue but we did refer him to the CLA Freedom of Information statement and explained that we do try to represent all points of view.	B C	September 4; Letter sent approximately September 20, 2014
P 1 3	Film ratings policy	Policy on film ratings being according to Canadian standards connected to challenge to DVD "Ted"	Offensive language Drugs/drug use Sexually explicit Patron requested monitoring by library staff as to who is borrowing this item (e.g., children)	Patron	Public	Policy retained The DVD was not added to the "restricted" collection, as its rating is 14A. Our "restricted" collection is for 18A and R-rated movies only. [Motion Picture Association of America/MPAA rating is Restricted]	O N	Jan 23; Resolved: February 24, 2014
P 1 4	Labelling policy	Policy on not labelling materials linked to challenge to DVD "Camp Harlow"	Religious viewpoint Packaging does not reflect the video's religious content concerning the Baptist church. There is nothing on the packaging that mentions the Christian/Baptist religion content in the video. The customer maintained that it was deceptive and violated OLA's Statement on the Rights of the Individual - "That the provision of library service to the public is based on the right of the citizen, under the protection of the law, to judge individually on questions of politics, religion and morality." She wanted it moved from the children's collection and labelled.	Patron	Public	Policy retained	O N	Aug. 8; Oct. 30, 2014
P 1 5	Labelling policy	Policy of not labelling content linked to challenge to adult non-fiction Audiobook Tough sh*t: Life Advice from a Fat, Lazy Slob Who Did Good	Offensive language [Sexually explicit] Customer thought it was a self-help publication. Did not like the content (offensive language, "porn"). Wanted a warning label affixed	Patron	Public	Policy retained No warning label applied		Oct. 27; Resolved Nov. 5, 2014
P 1 6	Film ratings policy	Policy on DVD classification [ratings] related to challenge to "Wallace and Gromit: A Matter of Loaf and Death"	Age inappropriate Customer felt it was not appropriate for the juvenile collection	Patron	Public	Policy retained DVD was retained in the juvenile collection after other libraries were checked for their collection placement		Resolved April 28, 2014
P 1 7	Film ratings policy	Policy on using Ontario Film Rating Board ratings linked to challenge to Post Tenebras Lux	Nudity	Patron	Public	Policy retained OFRB rating of 14A retained. Good reviews factored in the evaluation	O N	December 18, 2013; January 29, 2014
P 1 8	Location/classification policy	Policy to classify location (i.e., YA, adult, children's) of materials linked to Teeth by Hannah Moskowitz	Offensive language [Religious viewpoint] parent found the title of low standard, lacking warning for its explicit language, and blasphemous	Parent/guardian	Public	Policy retained Reviews were consulted, other libraries checked, and reason given not to move the title out of teen	O N	November 19; Response: November, 2014
P 1 9	Film ratings policy	Policy of classifying [rating] films by OFRB ratings linked to	Homosexuality Objected to not being warned about homosexual lifestyle content	Patron	Public	Policy retained	O N	Dec. 31, 2013; Response:

		challenge to A Single Man DVD						January 27, 2014
P 2 0	Access policy	Access policy to have parents monitor their children's borrowing linked to challenge to children's picture book Veggie Tales	Religious viewpoint It spreads Christian propaganda	[Parent]	Public	Policy retained Explained to patron that as a library we aim to have our collections reflect the diverse reading needs of the communities and individuals we serve, whether cultural, ethnic, or religious, and that we rely on parents to be involved in their children's use of the library, to reflect their own family's thoughts and values in their library selections	B C	Dec 12; Dec 22, 2014 – email sent to patron
P 2 1	Home delivery policy	Policy of home delivery for people with disabilities	Home Delivery for people with disabilities: Our current home delivery service requires that the patron switch to a different library card and borrower profile, for a variety of reasons. One of the reasons is the assumption that if a patron needs the specialized service of home delivery, they would not be able to nor need to pick up materials themselves from a branch. There are other factors as well, such as fine-free status, different due dates. The patron perceived this as a punitive restriction. Her email is copied below: Book Delivery Issues - why take away my regular card? Here is the complaint from the patron: Hello I'm disabled and cannot take the bus or drive. I was interested in your book delivery service through Outreach Services. I was informed on the application form that i would have to give up my regular library card. This makes me feel like a second class citizen and i can't see any good reason for giving up my card and my ability to take a book out on my own on the rare occasion i get a ride to the library. I was later assured, after enquiry, that i would be issued a new number that i could use to place materials on hold for delivery. Really, just let me use my normal barcode on my regular card. What is the problem?!	Patron	Public	So far no outcome. Patron did not respond to requests for follow up discussion. Library staff in Accessible Services agree that this policy -- while based on logic -- may be unnecessarily limiting and restrictive for some patrons. Subsequent discussions with library staff in branches verified this. In 2015 we will explore with Circulation, Systems and branches how we might provide greater flexibility for cardholders of home delivery service.	B C	July 19, 2014, not resolved
P 2 2	Collection policy	Collection policy, levelling	Age inappropriate Does not support curriculum Indiscriminate "weeding" of classroom and library collections in any and all areas. The administrator arbitrarily tossed out textbooks, books, videos on the grounds of being outdated or inappropriate from classrooms and the library, especially anything to do with the USSR because it no longer existed and the entire Aboriginal literature collection, because of the word Indian or Eskimo in the title.	School staff member	K-12 School, K-12 school library	Material retained [Policy retained] [Need to keep confidential to protect survey responder]	O N	unknown
P 2 3	Collection policy	collection policy, levelling	Does not support curriculum Levelling [Wanted all resources levelled] Wholesale removal from classrooms and library of all materials, literally thousands of books, deemed arbitrarily by the administrator as not specific to the provincial curriculum. The library has remained closed all fall.	School staff member	K-12 School, K-12 school library	Material retained [Policy retained] Upon formal grievance, the levelling was halted. Some details remain confidential	B C	Fall 2014
P 2 4	Labelling policy	Policy of not labelling resources linked to challenge to DVD "Snow Angels"	Violence [Suicide] Patron objects to two scenes in particular: drowning of a young girl; execution of wife by husband, then husband's suicide. Patron requests either add a label warning of extreme violence to the dvd case, or remove the dvd from the collection	Patron	Public	Policy retained	B C	March 20; Reply sent: March 31, 2014
P 2 5	Film ratings policy	Policy of rating films according to Consumer Protection BC linked to challenge to film Antichrist	Nudity Sexually explicit Violence Patron says "too...disturbing"; requests it be rated for 19 years and older	Patron	Public	Policy retained - Relocated to Restricted - [Policy followed – they'd broken their own policy in this case] [...] PL's policy is, in cases	B C	July 25; Reply sent: Aug. 1, 2014

						where an unrated film with explicit content is identified and there is a BC rating, the library will move the film to the Restricted films collection. For this reason, the DVD was relocated to the Restricted collection, in which Restricted films may be borrowed by patrons 18 years and older.		
--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--