

**List of Challenges to Resources and Policies
Reported by Publicly-Funded Canadian Libraries, 2006**

Challenges are listed alphabetically by number of challenges per item. (Note that unverified bibliographic data are recorded here as originally supplied by library officials who contributed to the annual survey.)

Individual item – 2 challenges each:

Survivor by J.F. Gonzalez

Individual item – 1 challenge each:

And Tango Makes Three by Peter Parnell and Justin Richardson

Beast of Monsieur Racine by Tomi Ungerer

“The Best of Shel Silverstein” (CD)

Betty Blue (DVD)

Bridge to Terabithia by Katherine Paterson

Cat on the Hill by Michael Foreman

Catch that Cat by Monika Beisner

Closer (DVD) directed by Mike Nichols

Embracing Skeletons by Peter Turnbull

Faun & Games by Piers Anthony

Green Arrow: Quiver by Kevin Smith

The Importance of Mohammad by Marilyn Oliver

Jokes Men Only Tell Other Men, vol. 3 of Yuk Yuk’s Joke Book

Julie of the Wolves by Jean Craighead George

Ladykillers (DVD)

Little Bird by Piet Grobler

The Little Black Book for Girlz: A Book on Healthy Sexuality by St. Stephen’s Community House

Matthew and the Midnight Flood by Allen Morgan

The New Dare to Discipline by James Dobson

Snow White in New York

Spaceballs (DVD)

Street Art: The Spray Files by Louis Bou

Twenty-Seven Bones by Jonathan Nasaw

The Waiting Dog by Carolyn Beck, illus. by Andrea Beck

Western Canada (DVD)

Wire in the Blood / The Mermaid Sings (DVD)

Written in the Flesh: A History of Desire by Edward Shorter

Ziggy Piggy and the Three Little Pigs by Frank Asch

Survey of Challenges to Resources and Policies Reported by Publicly-Funded Canadian Libraries, 2006

	Bibliographic info	Reason	Initial response	Who made complaint?	How initial response given	Final response	Type of Library	Province/territory
1	The Best of Shel Silverstein (music CD)	age-inappropriate	To move the material to a more appropriate area	parent	written	Moved the material to the adult section	public	BC
2	Spaceballs (DVD)	age-inappropriate	To move the material to a more appropriate area	parent	written	Moved the material to the adult section	public	BC
3	Twenty-Seven Bones by Jonathan Nasaw	violence, language	To keep material	patron	written	No change	public	BC
4	"Beast of Monsieur Racine" by Tomi Ungerer, 1971, children's picture book	age-inappropriate, violence, bloody foot in pic	Listened to customer's concerns and suggested customer complete a "Materials Reconsideration" form	parent	Verbal response at time of complaint followed by written response to information provided on "Materials Reconsideration" form.	No change.	Public	Ontario
5	Catch That Cat by Monika Beisner	occult, scary	To keep the material in the collection	parent	written	no change	public	BC
6	Julie of the wolves / Jean Craighead George	age-inappropriate, violence, sex	We would read the book, and respond	parent to principal to library services	Verbal	The book had been challenged in the past and we found evidence indicating that a note should have been included with the novel study indicating that parents should be advised prior to using this novel in the classroom.	school	
7	One was about a DVD entitled "Ladykillers"	language	We added a label on the box indicating the language is offensive and it's at viewer's discretion to view the movie.	patron	It's the library's policy to respond such complaints in writing.	labeling	public	
8	Little Bird by Piet Grobler	age-inappropriate	To keep the material in the collection	parent	written	no change	Public	BC
9	"Embracing Skeletons" by Peter Turnbull, 1996, adult fiction book	violence & sex against children	Listened to customer's concerns and suggested customer complete a "Materials Reconsideration" form	patron	Verbal response to concerns followed by written response to concerns expressed in completed "Materials Reconsideration" form	No change.	public	Ontario

	Bibliographic info	Reason	Initial response	Who made complaint?	How initial response given	Final response	Type of Library	Province/territory
10	Snow White in New York	age-inappropriate, violence, religious viewpoint	To keep material	parent	written	No change	public	BC
11	"Survivor" by J. F. Gonzalez, adult fiction book	violence, sexual violence	Listened to customer's concerns and suggested customer complete a "Materials Reconsideration" form	patron	Verbal response to initial concerns followed by written response to concerns identified in "Materials Reconsideration" form	Removed from collection in community libraries that are located in schools (one public, one Catholic) - kept in collections at all other library locations	public	Ontario
12	"Survivor" by J. F. Gonzalez, adult fiction book	violence, sexual violence	Listened to customer's concerns and suggested customer complete a "Materials Reconsideration" form	patron	Verbally responded to initial concerns, followed by written response to concerns noted on "Materials Reconsideration" form	Removed from community libraries that are located in schools (one public, one Catholic) - kept in collections at all other library locations	public	Ontario
13	Carolyn Beck. The Waiting Dog. (illus. by Andrea Beck), Toronto, Kids Can Press, 2003 (children's picture book)	age-inappropriate, violence, revolting, vile	"the offbeat humour may not be to everyone's taste, the book meets the selection guidelines established by the library. Not every book in the library's collections will be appropriate for every child or family. Picture book collections contain titles for a wide variety of ages and tastes. We rely on parents to screen library materials selected.	parent	written letter	retain the book in the collection with no change to classification, department.	public	Ontario
14	DVD: Betty Blue	nudity, age-inappropriate	R rated movies should be available for rental by adults only. Any child could take this off the shelf, without parental consent, and borrow it and view it without parental consent. Children are restricted from movie theatres showing such material. Why does the publicly funded library make such movies available to children?	patron	Written. Letter to complainant outlining process and timelines for response.	No change. DVD retained in the Library's collection.	public	Alberta
15	Edward Shorter. Written in the Flesh: a history of desire. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2005	age-inappropriate, nudity, sex, "photographs and images inappropriate for teens/children"	"agree these images are of a sexual nature, however, I believe it is the author's intention to explore changes in human sexual behaviour as a product of social conditioning throughout history. The library provides open access to our collections to users of all ages with the exception of movies classified as 'Restricted' by the Ontario Film Review Board. The library does not act in place of a parent for enforcing any restrictions they may place on their child. The author teaches medicine at University of Toronto. We own other books by the same author and note that many other neighboring public libraries also own titles by the same author. The book was selected based on a favourable review in several review journals and	patron	written letter	Retain the book with no changes.	public	Ontario

	Bibliographic info	Reason	Initial response	Who made complaint?	How initial response given	Final response	Type of Library	Province/territory
			the reputation of the author.					
16	The Little Black Book for Girlz; a book on healthy sexuality by St. Stephen's Community House, published by Annick Press, 2006		Customer believes the book is too frank and hence inappropriate for young women. Customer did not ask at the end of the conversation that the book be withdrawn from the collection.	parent	Verbal. Lengthy discussion with the parent, including answering her all her questions, reviewing the Library's Materials Selection Policy and ensuring she had access to a copy of this document, offering options. The book is catalogued young adult non-fiction; YA non-fiction is interfiled with adult non-fiction. The customer's child is a toddler.	No change at the point at which the staff member left the conversation.	public	Alberta
17	Cat on the Hill, Michael Foreman, Oct. 2005, children's paperback	language, age-inappropriate		parent	The Head Librarian and the library board met and reviewed the request for reconsideration of the book. Written	no change	public	Alberta
18	Dr. James Dobson - The New Dare to Discipline, Tyndale House Publishers, 1992, book		recommendation of spanking very young children	parent	written	item was retained in the collection	public	Ontario

	Bibliographic info	Reason	Initial response	Who made complaint?	How initial response given	Final response	Type of Library	Province/territory
19	Faun & Games by Piers Anthony paperback book, c.1997	sex, age-inappropriate	Patron also felt it was poorly written	parent	Asked the patron to fill out Request for Reconsideration of Library Materials form. In writing	Complaint was reviewed by the Library Board. Item was not removed on basis of the complaint.	public	Alberta
20	Graphic novel: Green Arrow: Quiver, by Kevin Smith	age-inappropriate	Graphic depiction/ description of violent child abuse. The book is very well written and entertaining and clever. It is just the ending, with a villain that is a demon worshipping Satanist that kidnaps, tortures and murders children - it crosses the line.	patron	Written. Letter to complainant outlining process and timelines for response.	Reclassified as adult fiction	public	Alberta
21	Book: Jokes Men Only Tell Other Men (volume 3 of Yuk Yuk's Joke Books)		Making disadvantaged social groups or specific segments of society an object of derisory humour for gratuitous purposes.	patron		No change. The book was retained in the Library's collection.	public	Alberta
22	Book: Matthew and the Midnight Flood, by Allen Morgan		A stranger comes to a little boy's bedroom window in the middle of the night, asks the boy to accompany him; the boy does because it "sounds like fun".	parent		No change. The book was retained in the Library's picture book Easy collection.	public	Alberta
23	Marilyn Oliver - The Importance of Mohammad, Lucent Books, 2003, book	religious viewpoint	considered depictions of Mohammad to be offensive	patron	written	item retained	public	Ontario
24	DVD: Western Canada by RV		The information is inaccurate or outdated and it presents a very negative and incorrect view of Canada. The DVD is produced by Americans for Americans in 2000. If a person watched this DVD and believed everything in it, you would think Canada has no cities, phones, roads, etc. This DVD is the ultimate in ignoramus americanus propaganda.	patron	Written. Letter to complainant outlining process and timelines for response.	No change. DVD retained in the library's collection.	public	Alberta
25	Bou, Louis. Street Art: The Spray Files. 2005. book		Concern about possible vandalism inspired by the book	patron	Collection development manager read the book and advised chief librarian about content; Chief librarian spoke to city councillor, who spoke to patron	Complaint was specific to one neighbourhood, so the offending copy of the book was transferred to another library branch	public	BC
26	Book: Ziggy Piggy and the Three Little Pigs, by Frank	age-inappropriate	Objects to "he blew the tiny raft far out to sea" and "...they all went for a swim." I don't know what the author was hoping children would learn from the actions of the pig. Yes,	parent	Written. Letter to complainant outlining process and timelines for response.	No change. Book retained in the Library's picture book collection.	public	Alberta

	Bibliographic info	Reason	Initial response	Who made complaint?	How initial response given	Final response	Type of Library	Province/territory
	Asch		he was a creative and perhaps a free spirit; however, he may have delivered his friends into greater danger. What is the lesson learned? Would recommend for mature students or children who would critique it to discover whether it would be suitable for publishing or reading to/by younger children.					
27	DVD-Wire in the blood/the mermaid sings	nudity, violence		patron	written. gathered reviews, examined & viewed DVD, discussed in collection development meeting	note added to record "contains graphic violence & some nudity"	public	Ontario
28	DVD Closer directed by Mike Nichols	sexually explicit, offensive language		patron	written. gathered reviews, examined & viewed DVD, discussed in collection development meeting	added missing CHV rating to the record	public	Ontario
29	And Tango Makes Three, P. Parnell, J. Richardson	Homosexuality religious viewpoint	Library asked for a review by Central Office Religious Education Dept.	Parent	Verbal & written	Removal	school	Alberta
30	Bridge to Terabithia, Katherine Paterson	Language ("pervert" "lordy" "see-through blouse"	The principal reported the complaint to me. We did not proceed with the complaint. We suggested that the teacher give the student another book to read.	Parent	None	None	school	