

**List of Challenges to Resources and Policies
Reported by Publicly-Funded Canadian Libraries, 2007**

Challenges are listed alphabetically by number of challenges per item. (Note that unverified bibliographic data are recorded here as originally supplied by library officials who contributed to the annual survey.)

Series – 2 challenges each:

The Golden Compass / His Dark Materials, trilogy by Philip Pullman

Individual item – 1 challenge each:

Adventures in Babysitting (DVD)

The Adventures of Tintin: Cigars of the Pharaoh by Hergé

And Tango Makes Three by Peter Parnell and Justin Richardson

The Basketball Player by Roch Carrier

Big Eden (DVD) written and directed by Thomas Bezucha

Brer Rabbit and the Tar Baby Girl by Virginia Hamilton

Buster's Sugartime by Marc Brown

Caligula (DVD) produced by Bob Guccione and Franco Rossellini

The Cat Who Killed Lillian Jackson Braun by Robert Kaplow

Dekatlon by Mira Markovic

Doing It by Melvin Burgess

Driftnet by Lin Anderson

Exit to Eden by Anne Rampling/Anne Rice

Fat Girl (DVD) written and directed by Catherine Breillat

Fiona (DVD) directed by Amos Kollek

Fly on the Wall, by E. Lockhart

I Capture the Castle (DVD) directed by Tim Fywell

Jane (magazine)

Last Tango in Paris (DVD) directed by Bernardo Bertolucci

Left Behind: A Graphic Novel of the Earth's Last Days by Tim LaHaye, John Layman & Jerry Jenkins

Les Lapins savent compter by Bruno Heitz

Looney Tunes Back in Action (DVD)

The Monkey King, vol. 1 of Dragon Ball by Akira Toriyama

Nick & Norah's Infinite Playlist by Rachel Cohn

Oliver Twist (DVD)

Open Minds to Equality: A Sourcebook of Learning Activities to Affirm Diversity and Promote Equity by Nancy Schniedewind

Perks of Being a Wallflower by Stephen Chbosky

Rainbow Boys by Alex Sanchez
Realm of Possibility by David Levithan
Rolling Stone (magazine)
Smokey by Bill Peet
Trans-sister Radio by Chris Bohjalian
The Treatment by Mo Hayder
Une Journée avec papa by Bertrand Fichou
Video Girl Ai
When Will Jesus Bring the Pork Chops by George Carlin
Yeelen (DVD) directed by Souleymane Cisse
Yo, Jo! by Rachel Isadora

Policies – 1 challenge each:

Internet filtering policy – Netsweeper filter will not disclose titles of blocked websites classified as pornography

List of Challenges to Resources and Policies Reported by Publicly-Funded Canadian Libraries, 2007

	Date	Bibliographic Detail	Nature of challenge	Who made complaint?	Initial response	How was initial response given?	Final response	Library type
1	03-07-2007	<i>Smokey</i> by Bill Peet, 1962, picture book	Racism	parent	Asked patron to complete a "Request for review of library materials" form as per library policy.	In-person followed by a letter to the patron	No change to status of material	Public
2	06-06-2007	<i>Oliver Twist</i> (Masterpiece Theatre version), DVD	violence, childbirth depicted	grandparent	Staff member asked patron to write out concerns. Manager of Children's and Teen Services viewed the DVD and researched production.	Telephoned patron to discuss her concerns	The DVD was reclassified as an adult title rather than a children's title.	Public
3	08-2007	<i>The Basketball Player</i> by Roch Carrier, 1996	age inappropriate	Parent	No change to status	In-person response followed by letter	No change to status	Public
4	05-2007	<i>Big Eden</i> , written & directed by	Homosexuality	Parent	No change to status	In-person response followed by letter	No change to status	Public
5	05-2007	<i>Fiona</i> , directed by Amos Kollek, 2001, DVD	nudity, sexually explicit, drugs, age inappropriate	Parent	Listen to concern	In-person response followed by letter	DVD moved from branch library to main library	Public
6	08-2007	<i>Dekaton</i> by Mira Markovic, 1998, Serbian language book	political viewpoint	Patron	No change to status	In-person response followed by letter	No change to status	Public
7	11-2007	<i>Rolling Stone</i> magazine	sexually explicit, age inappropriate	Parent	No change to status	In-person response followed by letter	No change to status	Public
8	11-2007	<i>Jane</i> magazine	sexually explicit, age inappropriate	Parent	No change to status	In-person response followed by letter	Magazine ceased publication in August 2007, so it was removed from the library.	Public
9	03-2007	<i>And Tango Makes Three</i> , by Peter Parnell and Justin Richardson, illustrated by Henry Cole, 2005	homosexuality, anti-family, religious viewpoint, age inappropriate	Parent	Went through procedure for complaints, including forms, board meetings, etc. Patron refused to put anything in writing.	In-person	No change to status	Public
10	07-2007	<i>Buster's Sugartime</i> by Marc Brown; New York, Little Brown: 2006. (Passport to reading, level 2)	homosexuality, same-sex parents	Parent	Library director spoke to the patron by telephone and discussed intellectual freedom and the library's selection policies. After the conversation the patron decided not to complete the library's "Reconsideration of Materials" form to formalize her complaint.	Telephone	No change to status	Public
11	20-09-2007	<i>Exit to Eden</i> by Anne Rampling/Anne Rice, 1996	sexually explicit, anti-family, religious viewpoint, age inappropriate	parent	We accepted the parent's concern and said we would review the suitability of the title in a senior secondary school. We told the parent we would objectively re-assess the complaint by re-reading and re-evaluating the title. We reminded them of our literacy goals and reviewed the district policy about selections.	By a letter to the principal - from the district staff. We did not receive input initially from the parent but was informed by our administrator. The district staff re-directed the parent's concern to the school.	We chose to keep the book in the catalog but re-classified the title as a local 'private' collection, (reserved) that required a discussion between student and librarian before any loan could be processed. A student loan needed subsequent parent approval.	School

	Date	Bibliographic Detail	Nature of challenge	Who made complaint?	Initial response	How was initial response given?	Final response	Library type
12	10-2007	<i>Yeelen</i> , directed by Souleymane Cisse, c.2002 (Kino Video), DVD	violence, cruelty to children, animals & the defenseless	patron	First, "Library User's Statement of Concern" form filled out by patron, then reply in writing from the Director of Libraries	By letter	No change to status	Public
13	2007	<i>Brer Rabbit and the Tar Baby Girl</i> by Virginia Hamilton	Racism	parent	To explain the history of the stories and the credentials of the author/illustrator to the patron.	In-person then by phone	Nothing changed - book was not removed or reclassified. Parent was still upset.	Public
14	12-2007	<i>The Golden Compass / His Dark Materials</i> trilogy by Philip Pullman	religious viewpoint	parent	No response as the challenge went to the board. The book remains on the shelf until after the formal review	No response yet. The meeting isn't until 15 Jan 08.	No decision yet	School
15	09-2007	<i>His Dark Materials</i> trilogy by Philip Pullman	religious viewpoint	parent	I explained that the books were very popular in the library and that Philip Pullman's religion or lack thereof was of no concern in the choosing of books for the library.	Through a personal interview in the library.	No change to status	School
16	03-11-2007	<i>The Monkey King</i> (Dragon Ball Vol. 1) by Akira Toriyama, graphic novel	offensive language, age inappropriate, "in the head of the parent – 'oh a 14 year old can see her underpants....'"	parent	Eye-rolling at the intolerance evident in the letter. Called the book in, then talked to the rural branches about, making sure that the YA graphic novels are not interfiled with the juvenile. Are drafting a response.	In-person via the branch librarian informing them of our procedure. When it has been evaluated by HQ a letter will be sent out to the patron.	No change other than verifying that the YGN are kept with the adult materials, not the juvenile and requested rural branch librarians to make any parents who may be concerned aware that the materials are not suitable for juveniles and may contain content that some perceive to be offensive.	Public
17	04-2007	<i>Perks of Being a Wallflower</i> by Stephen Chbosky, 1999; <i>Realm of Possibility</i> by David Levithan, 2004; <i>Rainbow Boys</i> by Alex Sanchez, 2001; <i>Nick & Norah's Infinite Playlist</i> by Rachel Cohn, 2006; <i>Fly on the Wall</i> by E. Lockhart, 2006	homosexuality, sexually explicit, offensive language, age inappropriate, sexual exploitation, complaint that library had purchased many copies	parent	Complaint submitted by e-mail to members of the Library Board, e-mail forwarded to Manager of Collections & Technical Services to respond on behalf of the Library Board. Library staff searched for review of the books, gave due consideration to the various issues raised by the customer, examined holdings and use of all the titles	Letter sent to parent via e-mail along with a copy of the Library's Materials Selection Policy	No change to status	Public
18	12-07-2007	<i>The Treatment</i> by Mo Hayder, 2001	sexually explicit, violence, sexual abuse of children	patron	Local staff offered patron library complaint form, "Comments on the Collection" then sent to Collections Coordinator for response	Collections Coordinator responded by letter	No change	Public
19	01-2007	<i>The Cat Who Killed Lillian Jackson Braun</i> by Robert Kaplow, 2003	sexually explicit, offensive language, exploits another author's name and reputation	patron	To retain the book in our collection	Letter	To retain the book in our collection	Public
20	13-06-2007	<i>Adventures in Babysitting</i> , DVD & <i>Looney Tunes Back in Action</i> , DVD	sexually explicit, offensive language, age inappropriate	parent	To retain the DVDs in our collection	Letter	To retain the DVDs in our collection	Public
21	17-07-2007	<i>Left Behind: A Graphic Novel of the Earth's Last Days</i> by Tim LaHaye, John Layman & Jerry Jenkins	sexually explicit, offensive language, religious viewpoint, age inappropriate	parent	To retain the book in our collection	Letter	To retain the book in our collection	Public

	Date	Bibliographic Detail	Nature of challenge	Who made complaint?	Initial response	How was initial response given?	Final response	Library type
22	05-12-2007	<i>The Adventures of Tintin: Cigars of the Pharaoh</i> by Herge	anti-ethnic, racism, sexually explicit, offensive language, religious viewpoint, age inappropriate	parent	To retain the book in our collection	Letter	To retain the book in our collection	Public
23	20-01-2007	<i>I Capture the Castle</i> , directed by Tim Fywell, 2002, DVD	nudity, age inappropriate	patron	The item has a PG rating and was placed in the adult video section. The patron took out the movie for herself and her children to view, thinking it would be okay since it had a PG rating. When she found that the movie had a nude scene (not sexual in nature), she was upset and wanted the library to modify the film's rating. The Head Librarian explained that the public library has no jurisdiction over film ratings and, as the movie is based on a popular YA book, it would not be removed from the collection. The Head Librarian then gently suggested that if the patron wished to ensure the films from the library were age-appropriate, that she choose her items from the children's movie section.	In-person	No change to status	Public
24	2007	<i>Les Lapins savent compter</i> by Bruno Heitz, Paris: Seuil Jeunesse, 2006, children's book	Violence	patron	Consulted reviews; retained	Letter	Retained, no change in status	Public
25	01-11-2007	<i>Last Tango in Paris</i> , directed by Bernardo Bertolucci, 1972, DVD	sexism, sexually explicit, violence	patron	Request was referred to relevant selector for information gathering (reviews, ratings, other holding libraries, etc.). Recommendation by selector, along with the information, is passed on to the Collection Development Committee for a decision.	When the request for reconsideration form was handed out the individual making the request, the patron is informed briefly of the process.	No change to status	Public
26	22-05-2007	<i>Doing It</i> by Melvin Burgess, 2003	sexually explicit, offensive language	parent	Request was referred to relevant selector for information gathering (reviews, ratings, other holding libraries, etc.). Recommendation by the selector, along with the information, was passed on to the Collection Development Committee for a decision.	When the request for reconsideration form was handed out to the individual making the request, he/she was informed briefly of the process. Once the Collection Development Committee has reviewed the recommendation and information, a final decision is made and the individual/group making the request is informed by letter.	No change in status	Public
27	2007	<i>Une journée avec papa</i> by	inappropriate humour	patron	Retained	Letter	Retained, no change in status	Public

	Date	Bibliographic Detail	Nature of challenge	Who made complaint?	Initial response	How was initial response given?	Final response	Library type
		Bertrand Fichou, Paris: Bayard jeunesse, 2006, children's book						
28	06-2007	<i>Yo, Jo!</i> by Rachel Isadora, 2007, picture book	offensive language, age inappropriate, "Customer complained that slang is inappropriate in a children's book because it's important to have grammatically correct language in works intended for children"	parent	Collections Management Coordinator and Children's Selection Librarian read the book, searched for reviews, discussed, then Coordinator met customer to review her concern	Initial response in-person; customer asked to see someone in charge. Follow up conversation by phone.	Resource was returned to children's library shelves	Public
29	2007	<i>Driftnet</i> by Lin Anderson, 2003	Violence	patron	Consulted reviews; retained title	Letter	Retained, no change in status	Public
30	23-09-2007	<i>Video Girl Ai</i> (no author listed), 2004, graphic novel	sexually explicit, violence, offensive language	parent	Request was referred to relevant selector for information gathering (reviews, ratings, other holding libraries, etc.). Recommendation by the selector, along with the information, was passed on to the Collection Development Committee for a decision.	When the request for reconsideration form was handed out to the individual making the request, he/she was informed briefly of the process. Once the Collection Development Committee has reviewed the recommendation and information, a final decision is made and the individual/ making the request is informed by letter.	Resource removed for reasons that have nothing to do with content. This was a broken series/old format.	Public
31	2007	<i>Trans-sister Radio</i> by Chris Bohjalian, 2000	sexually explicit	patron	Retained	Letter	Retained, no change in status	Public
32	2007	<i>When will Jesus Bring the Pork Chops?</i> by George Carlin, 2004	religious viewpoint	patron	Retained	Letter	Retained, no change in status	Public
33	Fall 2007	<i>Open minds to equality: a sourcebook of learning activities to affirm diversity and promote equity</i> by Nancy Schniedewind, 1998	political viewpoint, religious viewpoint, "Group objected to the use of the word 'homophobia', i.e. by definition making their beliefs an illness"	interest group	Since this book had been placed in all of our schools by the Family Life & Human Sexuality Department, it went back to this committee for review.	Most debate seemed to occur in the local press.	The book was removed from our school libraries, but kept in the central professional library	School
34	17-10-2007	<i>Fat Girl</i> , written & directed by Catherine Breillat, 2004, "Restricted" DVD	sexually explicit, violence, "No Canadian Home Video Rating available"	parent	Directed patron to collection policy, intellectual freedom document, library's role not to censor or rate materials	Two verbal discussions plus one letter	Investigated whether library could request a rating on an unrated DVD; item was transferred to a larger, Central library due to multiple complaints (4)	Public
35	12-2007	<i>Caligula</i> , produced by Bob Guccione, Franco Rossellini, DVD	sexually explicit, violence	patron	We explained why we thought it was worth having in the film collection. That fact that it is still being written about 27 years later.	The complaint was by e-mail and we responded by e-mail.	The patron did not ask to have the item removed and we did not take the copies out of circulation.	Public
36	12-01-2007	<i>My Most Secret Desire</i> by Julie Doucet, 2005	sexually explicit, "sexual filth", "sexual sickness"	patron	Librarian at the Information Services desk gave patron our "Request for Reconsideration of Library	In-person	No change to status	Public

	Date	Bibliographic Detail	Nature of challenge	Who made complaint?	Initial response	How was initial response given?	Final response	Library type
					Materials" form.			
37	22-01-2007	<i>Antares</i> , written & directed by Götz Spielmann, 2005, DVD	nudity, sexually explicit	patron	Librarian at the Information Services desk gave patron our "Request for Reconsideration of Library Materials" form.	In-person	No change to status but, as it happened, the entire DVD collection was relocated before the patron received the Library's final decision, unintentionally creating a more pronounced separation between the "family entertainment" DVDs and the foreign films. This change in proximity was noted in our reply to the challenge.	Public
38	21-03-2007	<i>The Madame Paul Affair</i> by Julie Doucet, 2000	"Pictures on front & back covers"; "Most dialogue takes place in a bar, or bed"; "feeling sleazy & dirty, like smoking & drinking"; "Julie Doucet has no morals or talent"	patron	Librarian at the Information Services desk gave patron our "Request for Reconsideration of Library Materials" form.	In-person	No change to status	Public
39	21-03-2007	<i>Little Man: Short Strips, 1980-1995</i> by Chester Brown, 1998	Pedophilia	patron	Librarian at the Information Services desk gave patron our "Request for Reconsideration of Library Materials" form.	In-person	No change to status	Public
40	12-01-2007	<i>The Frank Book</i> by Jim Wooding, 2003	"sexual vulgarity"; "introduction to sexual deviance"	patron	Librarian at the Information Services desk gave patron our "Request for Reconsideration of Library Materials" form.	In-person	No change to status	Public
41	21-03-2007	<i>Chaos Mission</i> by Peter Lorenz, 2003	drugs, violence, offensive language	patron	Staff member at the Information Services desk gave patron our "Request for Reconsideration of Library Materials" form.	In-person	No change to status	Public
42	12-01-2007	<i>The ACME Novelty Library</i> by Chris Ware, 2005	occult, pornography	patron	Staff member at the Information Services desk gave patron our "Request for Reconsideration of Library Materials" form.	In-person	No change to status	Public
43	On going	<i>Internet Filtering Policy</i> - "The extent of the blocked titles is unknown. The Netsweeper software blocks websites that have been classified as pornography on the terminals which are being filtered. It is unknown how this classification process occurs because the Netsweeper software is proprietary. By way of example of the challenged material, Netsweeper classifies the website maintained by Little Sisters Bookstore as pornography. So the page www.littlesistersbookstore.com/index_court.html is blocked. You can test a website to see its category at http://www.netsweeper.com (click on test a site)"	sexually explicit - "The library has installed filters on virtually all of the adult terminals throughout the system which blocks all content that the Netsweeper Company classifies as pornography. The vendor will not disclose how these decisions are being made."	Initiated by the CEO of the Library with the consent of the Board	The challenge came internally from the library management itself	The program first appeared at the May 2007 Board meeting when the written recommendation was first given to the Board	The Board voted to adopt the recommendation to conduct a "pilot project" at its May 2007 meeting and adopted a permanent filtering program at its November 2007 meeting.	Public